



**CHURCH AWARENESS AND PRACTICE OF TOTAL  
QUALITY MANAGEMENT IN NIGERIA.**

By

SUCCESS S. S. FADIPE

Being a Dissertation Submitted  
in Partial Fulfillment of the  
requirements for the award of  
the Doctor of Philosophy of  
St. Clements University.

OCTOBER 2002

## APPROVAL PAGE

This is to certify that this Research Project was carried out under our strict supervision and has been approved for submission to the Department in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the award of the Doctor of Philosophy - St. Clements University.

Signed:  
Academic Adviser

Signed:  
Administrator  
St. Clements University.

## DECLARATION

I, Success Samuel Sunday Fadipe do hereby declare that this work in its entirety is mine. The works of other people when used or referred to are duly and fully acknowledged.

Signed:

## DEDICATION

To the following:

1. Jesus CHRIST - My Saviour, Lord, Wisdom and Life.
2. My Wife, Blessings - The essence of love.
3. My children: Holyman, Topman and Toplady - the essence of continuous love.
4. The Church in Nigeria.
5. The Church Globally.
6. All Quality loving Men of GOD in the World.
7. Humanity universally.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

My heartfelt gratitude goes to the following for their immense contributions in diverse ways and capacities in making this Study a reality and Huge Success.

1. GOD the Almighty - For giving me good health and a sound mind filled with His Love for mankind.
2. Professor David Iornem, Director General of the Institute of Management Consultants, NNDC Building, Ahmadu Bello Way, Kaduna, Nigeria - My very able Academic Adviser, well endowed with success academic ideas.
3. Professor David Le Cornu, the able Administrator of St. Clements University - He receives my appreciation for proper and adequate direction and support.
4. Dele Aborishade, (Senior Manager, Research and Training), Eko International Bank PLC, Matori, Lagos, Nigeria - For adequate supply of research materials, books, plus valuable suggestions and contributions.
5. Banjo, Doris, Anthony and Biodun. My ardent employees who were tirelessly on Lagos City streets times unnumbered to interview and distribute questionnaires, saw to their completion and return.
  
6. Members of The CHRIST Centre worldwide (the Home of Good Success) - For their effective prayer support.
7. The Staff of the Institute of Management Consultants (IMC), Kaduna and Lagos, Nigeria - For immediate attention given to issues relating to my studies at all times.
8. My very self - for being hardworking, well focused and for purposeful living to the Glory of God and benefit of mankind.

## ABSTRACT

This study was aimed at finding out the awareness and practice of Total Quality Management (TQM) by the Church in Nigeria. It also examined the practical methods of TQM practice by different Church Organizations and the Success levels so far achieved. The climate contribution to the success of TQM implementation in the Church setting was also examined.

Some of the findings and conclusions are that very few Church organizations in Nigeria are aware of TQM. And very, very few understand its principles. A few number of Church organizations among those that are aware of it and its principles, do practice TQM in the Biblical and spiritual ways as suitable to the things of GOD. The outcome of the understanding, application and practice of TQM by the Church organizations that have implemented it in Nigeria is very encouraging. Positive results are physically evident in terms of Church spiritual and numerical growth, quality services to God, to members, to mankind and total man developmental physical evidences. It was also observed that in the very few Churches where TQM is succeeding in Nigeria, climate is a crucial provider of suitable environment for its take off, jolly ride, landing and continuous progress.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Title Page .....	i
Approval Page .....	ii
Declaration .....	iii
Dedication.....	iv
Acknowledgement .....	v
Abstract .....	vii

### CHAPTER ONE (INTRODUCTION)

1.1 Preamble .....	1
1.2 Statement of the problem .....	4
1.3 Objectives of the Study .....	6
1.4 Background and Rationale for the Study .....	6
1.5 Statement of Hypotheses .....	9
1.6 Limitation of the Study .....	10
1.7 Definition of Terms .....	10

### CHAPER TWO

2.1 Review of Related Literatures .....	13
---	----

### CHAPTER THREE (RESEACH METHODOLOGY)

3.1 Method of Data Collection .....	49
3.2 Investigation sample .....	51
3.3 Data Analysis Method .....	53

### CHAPTER FOUR

4.1 Data Presentation and Analysis .....	54
--	----

### CHAPTER FIVE

5.1 Discussion of Results .....	112
---------------------------------	-----

### CHAPTER SIX

6.1 Summary, Recommendations and Conclusions .....	114
--	-----

BIBLIOGRAPHY .....	121
--------------------	-----

APPENDIX I: List of Churches interviewed .....	128
APPENDIX II: Sample of successful Church TQM Practice in Nigeria.....	129
APPENDIX III: Sample of Research Questionnaire.....	135

## CHAPTER ONE

1.1 Preamble: Recent happenings in Nigeria, relating to security of life and property, contention with unexplainable conditions and diseases not medically explainable, hired killings, unemployment, social problems in diverse ways and the need of Eternal Life and God’s intervention in every area of man’ life have led and still leading to a large yield of Nigerians to God through the Church. Infact, ours currently is a God seeking Nation.

The rate of total dependency on God through the Church by Nigerians is on the increase daily. Nigerians’ interest in the Church and the things of God is rising rapidly as they turn in large numbers to God. God is seen as the last hope in the face of hardship, uncertainty of the future for some, hard economic situation for others and political leadership that cannot be trusted yet by many.

This trend has placed great demand on the Church; greater than it used to be before the nineties. The Church woke up suddenly to discover that God’s Business could no longer be done as it used to be; when no quality was practiced, neither in the Word, teaching and preaching, materials, physical structures, facilities nor in giving to God and in various Church benevolent societal practices.

It is getting clearer daily that Christianity and God’s business (i.e. Church) now requires the business approach (i.e. Purpose with hard work) and not religious approach (i.e. Pious ithout work). This has been the requirement by God which due to ignorance the Church has not been practicing. The Church over the years has played the weak one that waits for opportunities instead of creating opportunities for herself and others through hard work. The Church has dogged hard work for too long and almost arriving at hard life because when hard work is dogged the usual result is hard life. Total Quality Management calls for hard work and no one doubts its ability to wake up the Church to the realty of her calling.

Successful TQM requires both behavioral and culture change. Behavioral and culture change to customer quality. In Church, the “customer” is of four parts. God is first - that is, the Church satisfying God continuously by doing His perfect will and less of His permissive will. Leadership is second - that is, a two way beneficial relationship between the Church leadership and members. Members is third - that is, members making their togetherness beneficial to each other through the demonstration of God’s Love in practical ways. Non members is fourth - that is, the larger society by bringing to them the gospel of salvation, leading them back to God and helping them build Successful life based on the Word of God.

A key element of TQM is “continuous improvement.” In other organizations apart from Church, the competitiveness of any under this concept is based on continuous improvement of people, process and product/service. Though in the Church setting there is no competition per se and whatever looks like it is not divinely recognized, the same continuous improvement of People, Process and Service is highly necessary for effectiveness in God’s Own Business called Church. The destiny of human life is too important to be left in the hand of a Church that places little or no importance on quality.

Nigerians can be called globe trotters. They are highly mobile people who are found around the world. Church service processes and people improvement methods as found in Pentecostal fellowships for example in America, are different and considered higher than obtainable locally. When these Nigerians return on holidays or for good, they expect to enjoy similar if not the same level of service they enjoy abroad. This calls for quality improvement here at home as long as it conforms with the Bible.

Lateness is considered a bad thing in some key areas of life. But looking at lateness closely, it has a big advantage of compelling a late comer to start at the level of development on ground at his point of entry if acceptability and recognition will be achieved. This is the situation being faced by new Churches in Nigeria. It is either one matches the quality on ground or one surpasses it right from the on set, if he has the capacity to do so or he waits to prepare properly before starting at all.

The level of formal education of Church founders and leaders is getting higher and higher. So also is that of members from Church to Church. This has two quality implications. One, Church members mostly need the input of Pastors on what is called secondary level of spiritual interpretation of the Word. Each individual Church member by the help of literacy handles the primary level of reading the Word and getting out the basic initial meaning. Two, the Pastors now have to work harder than before by digging deep into the Word, in the very “presence of God” so as to receive rightly from God for proper feeding of the flock. The days of ordinary story telling on the pulpit have vanished and gone forever.

The urgent need of the Church in Nigeria is continuous improvement of services, people, processes and facilities to accommodate the numerical upsurge and to meet people’s aspirations, and God’s divine expectations on constant basis. How prepared the Church is to meet these challenges, how they are doing it right now, what methods are involved and how much success is being recorded are some of the issues examined in this work.

1.2 Statement of the Problem: The Church in Nigeria as well as all over the World is in the last age of the present time which was carved out of Eternity by GOD for obvious reasons. Satan the arch-enemy of God and man is on a serious rampage because it is clear to him that the time left for him is five minutes to 12 mid-night by God’s reckoning. Because of this, all hell is let loose on nations world over. The fall out of the secret activities of the devil are troubles and difficulties that human race is facing constantly; ranging from earthquakes, hired killing, unexplainable diseases, fire, flood, famine, wars, terrorism, etc..

In addition, satan is using all forms of deception in the name of the Church. For example, some “churches” are being used as criminal hide outs. Just a week ago, the “Pastor” of a “church” in Benin, Nigeria was reported by the press as caught for using her “church” to stock pile arms and hire them out to criminals for robbery purposes who in turn brought “returns” to the “Church!” There is a great cry in the land to know what a true Church is, what it should be doing, how it should be doing it, where it should be doing it; and most importantly the society expects from the Church total divine services as qualitatively packaged by God according to the Bible. The true Church of God has survived through the ages and it will continue to do so until the Owner (Jesus CHRIST) returns to take her home with Him. But meanwhile, the need is to create a proper image and to practice purposeful Christianity based on quality Church services, strong enough to confront the enemy and render him ineffective.

The tools for doing this are organizational self re-assessment, behavioral and culture change plus deliberate continuous improvement of people, services, skills, management, processes and members’ Word empowerment.

If the Church re-organizes herself from denomination to denomination, improves her people and processes, offering people satisfying services that are completely in line with the Bible and the Mind of God, the enemy will be left with little or no room. The rule here is to keep the Church members very busy with the way and things of God and satan will not get their attention because no one can serve two masters at the same time.

Nigeria’s present democratic culture has opened up the Country to international investments. Already, major investors like MTN, Econet, Stanbic Bank and many service offering firms are operating in the Country as a result. This trend has brought a lot of foreigners into Nigeria with their families. Some of them are seen in Churches in Lagos, Abuja, Warri and Port Harcourt, these days in their tens, running into their thousands. They will continue to increase as more Countries gain more confidence in Nigerian Democracy. The souls of these people must be catered for while they are here. This means more pressure and more patronage on the Church services in Nigeria.

The Church therefore is expected to come up with excellent services that will measure up to their expectations. Total Quality Management is sure to the rescue because its ideals and principles are very appropriate and adequate to tackle these challenges.

1.3 Objectives of the Study: The objectives of this study are clearly stated from the on-set and are based on the assumption that Church organizations that practice TQM would do better in service offering than those that do not. The objectives include establishing the level of Church awareness and practice of TQM in Nigeria; find out the methods being used by Church organizations that have applied TQM concept; discover the rate of success achieved so far and determine the reasons for success .

1.4 Background and Rationale for the Study: Total Quality Management has proved to be quite rewarding for certain business organizations in Nigeria in different industries ranging from banks to production. Some banks like Omega Bank, Standard Trust and

Diamond that operate purely in the service industry as the Church does, have come up with stronger image, better performance and increased customer patronage emanating from their higher level of continuous customer satisfaction that is achieved through TQM practices. Some Churches are noticed as implementing TQM, though silently without making too much noise about it as the banks do. Such Churches are noticed to be coming up with excellent results. Their results project themselves through numerical growth, spiritual and material well being of their members.

It is assumed that the Church being in the service industry as banks, though with more general public service appeal, can also reap bountifully by imbibing the TQM concept completely.

TQM is a committed management approach; and every achievement in life is at the mercy of commitment. That is why it takes a serious approach to command glorious results. The proper placement of the Church in Nigeria and in the life of her citizens will be a function of commitment to total quality. The Church that aims at sitting at the top of things in Nigeria should realize that the top is reserved only for the diligent in quality practices.

The parts of the Church that have already implemented the TQM concept need to be encouraged and told that the right thing is what they are doing. In Nigeria, the thinking, both in the Church and outside it, is that a heaven going Church must live in poverty all life. Once a Church is showing any level of prosperity than “usual,” such a Church is regarded as worldly. TQM creates wealth as part of its benefits for any organization that adopts its principles. Church organizations that have imbibed the concept and as a result are getting wealthy spiritually and materially need be encouraged. Others that have not imbibed the TQM concept need to come on board.

The wealth creation through TQM concept application are in two ways for the Church. One, is spiritual wealth which is achievable through quality Word preparation, delivery and practice. This compels the Pastor to spend more quality time in study and being in the presence of God to receive quality Word instructions for himself and for the people. And this can only come about by the Pastor’s awareness and knowledge of the need to offer quality Word nutrition all the time.

Two, is material wealth which is inclusive of all physical material blessings plus long life and good health. “Two” is achievable when “one” above is understood and properly applied. It is the spoken Word of God that creates “life” in the Church and outside it as it created this very World that we live in when God spoke for six days in Genesis Chapters 1 and 2 of the Holy Bible. The Word has not changed, it is as potent as ever could be.

Christianity is not synonymous with poverty. A Christian and his Church must take on the complete life of Jesus CHRIST. Jesus said, “I have come that they may have life, and that they may have it more abundantly.” (John 10:10b). The “life” mentioned in this statement is ETERNAL LIFE which a Christian receives the very moment he accepts Jesus CHRIST into his life. The Word “abundantly” in the second part of the statement is the attainment of material wealth in this world to be used for His glory. This also agrees

with Matthew 6:33. "But seek first the kingdom of God and His righteousness, and all these things shall be added to you." The entire and complete life of Jesus on earth was filled with both the spiritual wealth (i.e. the Word) and the material wealth which He displayed in many ways including the costly dress He wore to the cross at his crucifixion.

So expensive was it that the soldiers had to fight to get a piece of it each! No one would fight for inexpensive cloth or for a rag. He also went about in convoy of at least 12 people at a time. That company He kept took Him good money to keep for 3.5 years. He had a treasurer in the person of Judas Iscariot who kept the money bag. Poor people cannot employ accountants talk less of having treasurers.

Above all, the Heaven where God lives according to the Bible has its streets and walls adorned with pure gold, sapphire, topaz, emerald, etc - Rev. 21:18 - 21. As such wealth for the Church is divinely ordained in addition to Eternal Life which is the first priority.

TQM is needed by the Church in Nigeria as a Word fulfilling tool. God the Father has a great delight in TQM. And that is the main rationale for this study.

1.5. Statement of Hypotheses: The following assumptions form the basis of reasoning for this study.

- I. That many Church organizations in Nigeria have not heard of Total Quality Management concept.
- II. That the few Church organizations in Nigeria that know TQM have implemented it.
- III. That the Churches which have implemented TQM in Nigeria, do not have a deep knowledge of it.
- IV. That the Church in Nigeria sees TQM as anathema if applied to the things of God.

1.6 Limitations of the Study: The following limitations were encountered.

- a. Refusal to collect and fill questionnaires by some Church organizations that felt the Church had no business with TQM. To them, though they were very few in number (just four of them) the Church should busy herself with the Bible only. TQM was too worldly to attract attention!
- b. The reluctant attitude of Nigerians in attending to researchers promptly on the premise of "I have no time ."
- c. Those who refused to fill and return questionnaires in self deliberate effort to hide their ignorance of the subject tabled before them. The people in this category (though few) shied away because they were key figures of some sort in Christianity in Nigeria who would not want to be seen as ignorant of TQM.

1.7. Definition of terms: The following words are found at different locations throughout this work. They carry the following meanings in the mind of the author of this work.

1. Church: A corporate Entity with one recognition under God-comprising of Catholic, Protestant and Pentecostal in Nigeria and in the World.
2. Churches: This word refers to different and individual Church organizations or denominations.
3. Man: This word stands for both sexes: young, middle age and old.
4. Pastors: This is used as a generic word that refers to Church founders, leaders, overseers, apostles and the setmen.
5. Church Workers: These are people employed to work full time in the Church. They include Pastors, Evangelists, Teachers, Accountants, Medical Doctors, Musical Instrumentalists, Security, Clerks, etc.
6. Church Members: God Worshipers in a particular Church.
7. Word Nutrition: Spiritual proper feeding of members in a Church through Bible based Preaching and Teaching practices.

## CHAPTER TWO

### 2.1 Review of Related Literatures:

The level of education and civilization has been raised a great deal in the last few years in Nigeria. The information super high way, especially the internet phenomenon has opened the eyes of Nigerians wide to various happenings in other parts of the World. The effect of all these on industries and religion alike is constant sophistication in Nigerians' demand for quality in products and services, comparable to what is available elsewhere abroad. This explains why the crave for imported goods and sometimes services keeps rising generally.

The effect of this development is expectedly felt more in the urban centers with considerable impact on Christian religious practices. For instance, some Churches discovered particularly that in Lagos, Nigeria, they were losing members because they were not musical in their Church services in a city like Lagos, where enthusiastic living is a daily culture. Those Church organizations now have music incorporated into their services so as to meet the aspirations of the people. That is a marketing U-turn and practice by the Church and is biblically acceptable. This practice is constantly being improved upon by the Churches concerned so as to satisfy God and Church attendants musically by a constant provision of latest musical gadgets and the acquisition of the necessary skills to play them.

The instruction of Jesus when He was going was very clear - occupy till I come by preaching the Good News to mankind. But how can this be done without one first getting the attention of the people. And the attention of mankind (Nigerians inclusive) can be got and held in today's world, only by the Church developing high grade ability to offer selfless and Godly services to meet and exceed the expectations of people. This is where the application of TQM concept comes in handy to effect continuous improvement on the

valuable services that the Church gives to the society. It is a serious business that must be totally done in line with the Bible, in practice. That phrase “occupy till I come” simply means do business with this till I come. The Church is therefore mandated to trade with Bible information till He returns. Trade the information without charging for it (Proverbs 23:23). Most Churches are still operating on the premise of ‘what will happen will happen.’ But by experience one knows that ‘what will happen will happen’ always ends making nothing to happen. Waiting to succeed is waiting to be crowned a failure in life. In John 5:17, GOD the Father of all is still working therefore work via TQM is a must, not a choice for the Church in Nigeria.

From this point, the process of this work in literature review will follow certain Total Quality Management principles as discovered during the study of TQM in details. This will be done in comparison with the new work in hand, bringing out new ideas and contributions to knowledge.

Without these principles, there can hardly be any workable TQM. The principles are the Body, Soul and Spirit of Total Quality Management and they include its definition and meaning, management commitment, customer focus and satisfaction, continuous improvement, quality circles, beyond quality, communications, staff empowerment, process improvement, team education, measurement, organizational climate, lean production, loss function and selected suppliers. The benefits of TQM will also be looked into because without derivable benefits, any human efforts are directed at nothing.

2.1:1 Definition and meaning: Before the definition of TQM is attempted, the meaning of TQM will first of all be dealt with by looking at the three key words of TOTAL, QUALITY AND MANAGEMENT. The word “Total” according to Collins English dictionary (1977, P542) means whole amount, sum, complete, entire, full and absolute. But in the TQM sense, according to Besterfield et al (1995, P1), total means “made up of the whole.” Kermally (1996, P41) and Iornem (1998, P127) see “total” as meaning that everyone in an organization plus all the organization’s resources being focused on satisfying the customer on continuous basis.

Dale H. Besterfield et al (1995, P1) see “Quality” as “degree of excellence a product or service provides.” In a recent television teaching broadcast by Dr. Myles Munroe of Bahamas Faith Ministries International on

Trinity Broadcast Network (TBN), he defined “Quality” as fitness for purpose. John S. Oakland (1989, P3) sees quality as simply meaning, “meeting the requirements.” He quoted other authors as follows - “fitness for purpose or use” Juran. “The totality of features and characteristics of a product or service that bears on its ability to satisfy stated or implied needs” BS 4778, 1987 (ISO 8402, 1986) Quality Vocabulary: Part 1 International Terms. “The total composite product and service characteristics of marketing, engineering, manufacture, and maintenance through which the product and service in use will meet the expectation by the customer.”- Feigenbaum. Oakland feels

that the word “quality” alone may not be sufficient because he thinks “reliability” works hand in hand with quality. Most people will buy tangible products like motor cars for their reliability in addition to quality he argues.

Reliability is the ability of a product or service to continue to meet the customers’ requirements. That is, the ability of a product to function suitably in line with its creation purpose for a reasonable long period of time.

“Management” means getting things done through people - Iornem (1998, P92); “... an operational process initially best dissected by analyzing the managerial functions... planning, organizing, staffing, directing, leading and controlling” - Koontz et al (1994).

G. A. Cole (1996, P4) quoting Henni Fayel said “to manage is to forecast, and plan, to organize, to command, to coordinate and to control.” I see Management as a skillful use of means to achieve organizational or personal goals profitably.

TQM Definition: Various attempts have been made by many authors, the following being some of them. David Iornem (1998, P127) “... the continuous improvement of individuals, groups, departments and of organizational processes focused on meeting customer requirements first time and always.” Dale H. Besterfield et al (1995, P1) see TQM as both a Philosophy and a set of guiding principles that represent the foundation of a continuously improving organization. It is the application of quantitative methods and human resources to improve all the processes within an organization and exceed customer needs now and in the future.”

Heinz Weihrich et al (1993, P650) see TQM as “the organization’s long term commitment to the continuous improvement of quality - throughout the organization, and with the active participation of all members at all levels - to meet and exceed customers’ expectations.”

I see TQM as the sum total of an organization, working towards and achieving the improvement of quality first time and always, aimed at delivery of quality product or service benefits to customers on a continuous basis.

The application of this in the Church is that, Church as a service offering centre is expected to function in tandem, denomination by denomination, to produce and deliver quality services first time and always for the benefit of members specifically and the society generally on a continuous basis.

2.1:2 Management Commitment: The success or failure of TQM after implementation by an organization is dependent on the top management. It is the Management that decides the adoption of TQM in the first place. It is the same management that sets the objectives and goals for its implementation. The same management sets up the quality council, empowers it, funds it and gives it life continuously.

All these and more call for complete commitment by the management for it to succeed. If the management fails in these responsibilities, the outcome will not just be only unsatisfactory but far below expectation.

Kid Sadgrove (1995, P20) in contending that TQM is a management - led process which requires the top management's commitment, says the big boss is in-charge who is to start the programme and see to it that it is sustained. A lesser company executive needs the approval of the big boss to start and needs the boss' commitment for its progress and sustenance.

Chopping (1991, P346), "commitment to Total Quality involves living Total Quality through a total belief in the world that Total Quality will create." This is a powerful statement that will take a top management understanding, commitment, action and continuous commitment and action to achieve.

Total Quality expectedly creates a world of quality success for its adopters, all things being equal. The Japanese industrial prowess and benefits are living examples. To achieve the well talked about world of quality success, demands complete commitment by the top management. Jesus CHRIST as the TOP MANAGEMENT of the Church understood this when He demonstrated complete commitment to His assignment on earth which He called "my Father's business." At the age of twelve, His parents and brothers looked for Him for three days before they could find Him in the Temple at Jerusalem sitting among doctrinal doctors and philosophers of His time, teaching them!

When they asked why they had to look for Him all over, He calmed them down and said "did you not know that I must go about my Father's business?" - Luke 2 : 49. Jesus has carried on with this commitment till date. His enviable approach calls for hardwork in addition to complete commitment. What TQM approach can be more than this? The Church in Nigeria should follow suit by living total quality through a total belief in the world that total quality will create for Nigerians in CHRIST Jesus.

Total Quality Management has the power of refocusing an organization by laying total emphasis on the Customers and not the employees nor the company itself. When an organization arrives at this level of understanding, commitment and total belief, it is sure to succeed. When the Church arrives at this very point of sure understanding that people are God's focus for all genuine Church set-ups, the emphasis will change from the wrong money seeking type to people seeking - the heartbeat of God; His main focus for sending His only begotten Son to die for man's redemption - John 3 : 16. Jesus while here on earth showed the way of complete commitment to quality in service. Each Church leader who wants to succeed in Nigeria cannot do otherwise. More over, a quality committed Church can be built only by a quality committed leader. It is certainly a question of show me your Pastor and I will tell you how your Church looks like on the spot!

Out of nine reasons given by Sadgrove (1995, P22) for TQM failure, eight of the reasons are directly management induced. The only reason outside the management's control is

number six as shown below which management may not have the capacity to foresee or to thwart.

1. Top management sees no reasons for change because current market situation is good enough.
2. Top management is not concerned for staff or future of the organization.
3. Top management implements TQM only because others are doing so.
4. Top management loses interest mid-way and abandons it.
5. Top management cannot see eye-to-eye on what TQM is all about.
6. Sudden sales decline mid-way into TQM.
7. Top management imposes TQM on an unwilling workforce.
8. Top management sets no performance targets from beginning, so no measurement of success can be done.
9. Top management has not analyzed processes very well for effectiveness.

Besterfield et al (1995, P2) see TQM as requiring six basic concepts. The first of the six and the most essential is “a committed and involved management to provide long-term top-to-bottom organizational support.” The issue of “involved” brought in here adds a new positive dimension. It is possible for top management to be committed to TQM and not be physically involved.

A top manager can decide to give TQM a go-head, fund it well and simply call into the organization TQM experts or assign the responsibility to a manager without his personal involvement from time to time. Commitment alone is not enough; personal involvement of top management is not negotiable.

Besterfield also mentioned something very significant - “... long-term...” This explains the futuristic aspects of TQM. Agreed that the concept may not produce immediately because the fruits usually become realizable years after its implementation as the Japanese have experienced. But the term “to provide long-term... organizational support” connotes that there is an anticipated ending to management commitment some day. This is not in agreement with the tenets of TQM of an unending practice, commitment and involvement.

Once a Church organization adopts TQM, it should be an un-ending practice and commitment. This should pass on from generation to generation. Leadership successors should be developed to carry on the TQM tradition which must have been built over years. That was what Jesus did by appointing the twelve disciples headed by Simon Peter who went ahead with the work after He left.

2.1:3 Customer Focus and Satisfaction: While customer focus is the turning of an organization’s major focus on the customer through behavioral and culture change, satisfying the customer is by turning that focus into an understanding of the customer requirements and needs.

Heinz Wehrich et al (1993, P4) said that “the aim of all managers is the same: “to create surplus.” TQM makes the surplus creation possible in three ways. One, the “surplus” as excess cash (profit), made above the introduced capital and all expenses in total at a point of accounting. Two, the “surplus” as astonishing satisfaction given by a product or service to customers, well above customers’ expectation. Third, the “surplus” of continuous satisfaction, based on on-going improvement from time to time. The problem with some Church organizations in Nigeria today is that members are quite often disappointed by poor quality in the Word preaching. More and more souls are hungry for quality preaching of the Word. It is amazing how they rush for this Sunday mornings in Nigeria.

But this week the preaching is good, powerful and up-lifting, next week a different story because the sermon is ill prepared. Some preachers do not know their purpose of being there, so it seems. Others, who know, find little or no time to study and be alone with God so as to receive from Him.

They often “depend on the Holy Spirit” to speak without their personal adequate preparation which Jesus referred to in John 14:26 (...Holy Spirit ... shall bring to your remembrance...) what you have learnt! A pastor who has learnt nothing is reminded of nothing and so he preaches without fruits. The apostles who took over from Jesus reiterated this point when they said in Acts 6:4 “But we will give ourselves continually to prayer, and to the ministry of the word.” After saying so, the apostles focused mainly on preaching the Word after appointing seven deacons (Acts 6: 5 & 6) to take over other Church jobs that might hinder the apostles from concentrating on the Word.

The outcome was that “the word of God increased, and the number of disciples (members) multiplied in Jerusalem greatly; and a great company of the priests (members) were obedient to the faith.” - Acts 6 : 7. The soul’s satisfaction in the Church can only come from the Word, rightly preached and applied. This is so because when Jesus was leaving, He left the Word in the world for us (John 17:14a). He later sent the Holy Spirit to help Pastors teach the Word through adequate personal study constantly. The Holy Spirit also helps the members to understand clearly what a preacher is saying. The Holy Spirit has three fold assignments in this world according to John 16:8 to 11 as follow:  
John 16:9 -- to reprove the world of sin because they believe not on Him.  
John 16:10 -- to reprove the world of righteousness.  
John 16:11 -- to reprove the world of judgment, because the prince of this world is judged  
- all three possible through proper Word application.

Unruh (1996, P23) made a powerful statement that further pushes customer satisfaction as a must necessity for survival. Unruh said “even if an organization isn’t focused on its customers, its competitors are. And the customers know where to find those competitors.”

One should ask at this point why some Churches are overflowing with members the right way and why others even though founded many years back, have few members? One

should also ask why members move from one Church to another? There can be no other answer than lack of satisfaction.

In Church matters, the quality of service in a particular Church is in the service itself but members may not see it that way. And when this happens, the quality is in what they think it is. Here lies a major difficulty. Individual members have individual needs and wants apart from the main thing - ETERNAL LIFE. Meeting these extra needs of man (be it healing, assistance, blessings, encouragement, etc.) puts pressure on Church leadership because it requires clear understanding and careful management.

In their work "The Customer comes second," Rosenbluth and Peters opined that in the service industry, the employees (the service people) should come first.

They said this on the premise that satisfied employees will always produce satisfied customers and business continuity. This may be true but in the Church setting, the full time Church employees (service people) cannot come first. The One who dictates the preference is God the Father. And He has said that people (that is human beings – members in particular are His first priority). That is the extent of His love for human beings. The reason why the Psalmist wondered in Psalm 8 : 4 that "what is man, that thou art mindful of him? And the son of man, that thou visitest him?" In the Church therefore, members come first, not the Church full time workers as Rosenbluth and Peters advocated. Their advocacy may work in other service organizations, it will not work in the Church because it goes contrary to God's arrangement.

While the Church full-time workers (internal customers) may not come first as opined by Rosenbluth and Peters, the habit of paying them poorly and working them in inconvenient situations as it is in most Church organizations in Nigeria today, should be discontinued with. Good salary, good working environment and better conditions of service should be introduced. It is believed that a well satisfied worker will produce satisfied customers even if he is only doing so to keep his job. Paul the great gospel worker for Jesus said I lacked nothing, "I have all, and abound.

I am full..." how? Because he was well taken care of "having received of Epaphroditus the things which were sent... a sacrifice acceptable, well-pleasing to God." Philippians 4 : 18. Because his needs were adequately catered for, Paul made most achievements for God than others before him. It is imperative to pay Church employees very adequately. The pay if not more, should not be lower than their counterparts outside the Church.

2.1:4 Continuous improvement: Klein Donald et al (1994, P27) opined that total quality management is one key factor for describing an organization's commitment to continuous improvement of its policies, products and organizational systems. In other words, TQM thrives best by continuously improving polices, education, communication, preventive maintenance, goals, climate, accountability, quality, culture, equipment, facilities, employees and even management, aimed at customers' satisfaction.

An e-library printable article on the internet (2002) titled “building a continuous improvement culture” said that there are barriers or constraints which are at the heart of an organization’s inability to realize its full potential from its people, process, materials, equipment and environment.

These constraints, which are usually attached to items enumerated above should be identified and corrected so as to achieve success in TQM implementation.

Continuous improvement has three facts on which it operates.

Fact One: It operates on the spirit of perfection

Fact Two: Constancy of action

Fact Three: It never ends.

In support of fact one, Stahl (1995, P47) said “if it isn’t perfect, make it better...” That is, the goal is perfection from beginning to finishing. Perfection is sought after at each stage by each section of the production process of a particular product.

Stahl’s thought is not totally perfect in that it encourages the producer (in a sense) to wait till the end before discovering the imperfection which is to be made better. That will not only lead to waste of resources and rework, it will come to “quality control” of the past. Instead, the focus should be perfection all the way from inspection to finish and that should be constantly kept. James Zawacki, chief executive officer of Grand Rapids Spring and Wire (GRS & W) had this to say when interviewed on the subject of focus. “Focus is very important because you can’t be all things to all people no matter how big or small your company is. You’ve only got so much time, capital, and talent available and if you’re running in twenty directions, it’s a killer.” Lack of focus is an enemy of good quality, a close friend of poor quality and failure in the market place.

Constancy of action which is fact two hinges on two things. The first is the sustenance of the perfection stage already reached by a product on constant basis. The second lies in constant search for improvement because the word “perfection” is a misnomer in the actual sense and in its true meaning. Any man’s work cannot be totally perfect on earth. There is always room for improvement. Stahl (1995, P261) said one can achieve improved value to customers by constant refinement and improvement of one’s product, service and systems.

The never ending factual part of TQM creates and maintains an organization’s leadership in the market. It is note worthy that once an organization has achieved “matured TQM,” it becomes a treasure to be kept for life. To drop TQM at this stage by paying less attention to it on the pretence of “success already in the kitty” is like removing the gas cylinder from the burner when cooking is still going on.

This cannot be better said than Ho’s authoritative statement (1999, P30). “Total Quality Management is a necessity. It is a journey. It will never end.” Kevin Wilson Smith also says of Gestetner where he is the current TQM manager that Gestetner “is not merely looking at short-term benefits, although these exist. Rather than being tied to a budget

year, TQM is focused on medium to long term benefits, thereby ensuring constant improvement over time.”

2.1:5 Quality Circles: These are Japanese approach to quality which they started in Japan after the second world war. A Quality Circle offers participatory management opportunity to employees. It is a worker motivator that creates a working climate of trust. Glover (1993) and Ouchi (1981), said “first, however, employees must sense a climate of trust before they can offer maximum commitment to TQM. A climate of trust permits employees to be sold on a project.” Kelvin Wilson-Smith, TQM manager at Gestetner in an e-library printable article (2002) said “this model has allowed Gestetner to improve its offering on all fronts. Since implementing the TQM methodology, we have found it a practical driving tool, inspiring employees to improve upon both processes and service.”

John S. Oakland (1989, P252) defines quality circle “as a group of workers doing similar work who meet voluntarily, regularly, in normal working time, under the leadership of their supervisor, to identify, analyze, and solve work related problems and to recommend solutions to management.”

Oakland thinks that where it is possible, members of a quality circle should be allowed to carry out their own recommendations. Why? because the commitment will be there to implement and see to it that maximum “profits” are obtained there from.

However, Kit Sadgrove (1995, P78) observed that quality circles are not labour unions; as such they cannot discuss pay and conditions of service because these are meant to be negotiated. They can also not discuss individual people because personnel problems must be handled professionally. “Everything else is suitable,” he said. In the Church setting in Nigeria, quality circles are represented by what is called committees or groups of various types with various names from denomination to denomination. Thus we have “harvest committee,” building committee,” “special project committee,” “counseling committee,” “hospitality committee” and so on and so forth. Each of these committees works for the interest of all, some of them like the “progress committee” and “prayer committee” work continuously year in year out. Each committee makes recommendations to the Church Leadership who takes final decisions and executes such decisions sometimes through the committees or by themselves.

2.1:6 Beyond Quality: Before the present hyper philosophies and sometimes-complex complications which competitive activities have fostered on the world, it used to be simple production based on some possible measure of quality. Measure of quality kept through simple quality control observations. But that has since become history.

The industrial temperature has almost read up all the degrees on the thermometer! That makes the arrival of TQM a great human discovery and its fire is catching on more and more worldwide. Byrne, 1992, Gagne, 1983, Lowe et al, 1986 all agree that “TQM provides a paradigm shift in management philosophy for improving organizational effectiveness.” One of the tools of TQM for effective working is beyond quality concept. An organization will say to itself and staff that for our product or service to beat competition and keep us in business continuously, we must dazzle the customers beyond

their quality expectations. And this is not negotiable. Though in the Church setting there is no recognized competition but the fact of life is that people do move from one Church to another when they are not satisfied. This is enough a signal for Church leaders to keep on improving their quality by getting back and closer to God the Author of all Godly improvements.

The passion for quality demands for Crosby's four "quality absolutes" as enumerated in "Productivity and Quality Management" J. Prokopenko (1996, P9-16).

1. The definition of quality is conformance to requirements.
2. The system of quality is prevention.
3. The performance standard is zero defect.
4. The measurement of quality is the price of non conformance.

Each of these important "quality absolutes" has great implications for the Church in Nigeria. Let us look at them one by one.

1. "Conformance to requirements" is Godly and specifically on target as to how God wants His work done in details to the minutest piece - Exodus 36:14 to 18 gives an example of how full of details our God is. Because of non-conformance to His requirements Saul was rejected by Him as king in Israel (I Samuel 15: 22 & 23).

2. "Prevention" requires the Church leader and members alike to be highly watchful so as to disallow the enemy (satan) from wrecking havoc in the Church or in the life of members. 1st Peter 5:8 says "Be sober, be vigilant because your adversary, the devil, like a roaring lion walketh about, seeking whom he may devour."

3. Zero defect: See what this will do if achieved in just one service arm of the Church, e.g. the Choir. Heaven will have been brought down to earth! Zero defect is the plan of God for the Church and the activities there in. Hear this: Ephesians 5:27 "That he might present it to himself a glorious church, not having spot or wrinkle, or any such thing; but that it should be holy and without blemish." That is core zero defect as put in place by God as a standard set for Himself as a task.

4. Non conformance standards in the Church will result in keeping His laws adequately; the Church will get garishly purified and sanctified. The level of quality will increase in all its service areas.

2.1:7 Communication: Without communication, two ways for that matter TQM is totally impossible. TQM begins, progresses and continues only on the smooth going vehicle of communication between the management and employees. Oakland (1989, P239, 240, 241, 255) observed that communication can take either or all of the following forms: by examples, direct verbal, indirect verbal, skills, visual and written. Oakland (1989, P242 to 247) makes some more communication suggestions method which are quite useful.

They include suggestion schemes, departmental talk-ins with brief and short departmental issue discussions, induction and vocational training, point of work reminders through stickers, departmental competition, prizes and formal presentations, demonstrations, exhibitions, house magazines, newsletters, special papers, company opinion surveys and poster campaigns. Poster campaign in-house are quite powerful in brain washing of the employees, especially if the wordings are carefully crafted. Some examples are given below and are quite powerful when produced and used with quality self explanatory graphic illustrations.

- There is a way to do it perfectly, find out.
- Quality is in your hands.
- Does your piece fit perfectly?
- Get it right first time, avoid waste
- Quality starts here
- The next person who checks your work will be your customer
- Customer is our life, quality is his food
- Our quality starts with you.

The Church in Nigeria can do so much internal TQM Communication and education work by adapting this technique.

2.1:8 Staff Empowerment: The principle of empowerment is that employees lower down the ladder should be encouraged to make useful contributions to problem solving. Kit Sadgrove (1995, P64) opined that junior staff should be encouraged to make decisions in addition to contributions.

That if allowed as Sadgrove advocated, may not only violate the spirit of TQM, but can lead to draw backs for the organization when and if terrible mistakes are made. Employees lower than the ladder should contribute to decision making and stop at that. Useful contributions should be implemented and be seen as implemented by the employee contributors. This, one thinks, is adequate enough.

Church organization is totally different. God's order is autocratic when He speaks. And His organization method is vertical never horizontal. Not even the Church leader dares to ask question or disobeys, talk less of members. The leader who tried to question God through unbelief in the Bible became dumb instantly for nine month (Luke 1:18 to 20)!

However, staff empowerment is possible in the Church in certain areas of opinion contributions and in useful suggestion making. Full time Church workers do meet from time to time to sort out nagging un-strategic problems. Suggestion boxes are used by others.

While some use appointed committees to handle some issues. One thing is sure over the years, Church leaders who have used the democratic method to run their Churches have come to regret their actions.

It has come out to be either lack of adequate progress, outright stagnation or complete frustration. God's method is the only method that works in Church Management and that

method is vertical: one God - one leader - one fold (Church) in that order. Anything outside this is trouble seeking.

2.1:9 Process Improvement: Before this can be achieved, Besterfield et al (1995, P79) said current process must be well analyzed by determining the key activities that make up a complete process.

The approach is to gather data, define the process boundaries, outputs and customers, inputs and suppliers and process flow. Identify root causes and determine levels of customer satisfaction. A process flow chart or diagram is needed to do a good job in flow analysis.

The Church has many service delivery centres within itself and outside it. Such as evangelistic outreaches, mercy and compassion to the needies, Sunday pulpit preaching, maternity services, schools, Bible study, children Sunday school, hospitality, transportation, security and different help centres. Each of these, needs improvement on continuous basis to effect better quality service delivery. The flow chart is quite handy for achieving necessary improvement from time to time.

Besterfield et al went on to point out that in some situations, the flow chart is not enough to determine if a process is meeting specifications. A more sophisticated approach is necessary.

He therefore suggests the use of control chart for variables or simply put as attribute analysis chart. The advantages of the chart are

- (1) It determines the average quality level.
- (2) Brings to management's attention any changes in quality either increase or decrease and
- (3) Improves the product or service quality by motivating operating and management personnel to initiate ideas for quality improvement.

2.1:10 Team Education: Without gain saying it, education is a major factor that makes any TQM adoption a success. In most organizations where it is being adopted, TQM education has to run down from top management to the least workers. Highly capable employees who will create, produce and sustain the customers' interest and satisfaction continuously must be TQM educated and trained. The cost of training in cash and time can be enormous.

Deming (1996, P24) instructed that a vigorous programme of education and self-improvement must be instituted. He however did not say in details how this should be done. Oakland (1989, P263) came to his rescue when he detailed the training elements and how to review the effectiveness of training.

The training elements include ensuring that training is part of quality policy, assigning training responsibilities, ascertaining training objectives, establishing training organization, specifying quality training needs, preparing training programmes and materials, training implementation and monitoring, plus results assessment.

Reviewing training effectiveness is not an easy task; despite that, it should be a continuous process. What to look for are content and levels of assimilation. And this can be done through the use of quality audits and by comparing employees' behaviour with the objectives of the training programme afterwards.

In the Church in Nigeria, especially in the urban areas, various kinds of training are conducted on weekly if not daily basis. The only thing one notices around is that some of the contents are shallow. The Church trainers need to work harder and more. Training quality needs to be highly enhanced. The trainers themselves should be trained constantly.

At a recent Church training in Nigeria, Rev. Success while explaining training involvements quoted Munro-Faure et al (1995, P48) in modification as follow - "to achieve the involvement of every Church member requires their commitment. Commitment requires understanding. Understanding requires training. Training requires management commitment, planning and time."

2.1:11 Measurement: IT Web/All Africa Global Media Via Comtex dated May 10, 2000 reported on the internet Gestetner's involvement and success with Total Quality Management. Gestetner TQM experience is one good example of TQM performance measurement.

First of all, Gestetner reported "since implementing the TQM methodology, we have found it, a practical driving tool, inspiring employees to improve upon both processes and service."

Kelvin Wilson-Smith, TQM Manager at Gestetner while applauding their success story said among other things that the comprehensive tool that TQM is allows for measurement and analysis on all levels of the company and within any business sphere. W-Smith cited staff satisfaction as an example. "When considering employee satisfaction, staff turnover is a very reliable indicator as we are able to establish a turnover average with the help of the TQM model."

"With this knowledge in hand we can then effectively evaluate trends in different regions, departments and even segments within certain departments - all in order to establish areas for improvement, ranging from training to job satisfaction measures."

Gestetner's experience as reported on the internet revealed some measurement weights which included customer satisfaction as priority number one, business results, processes, leadership, people management, strategies and planning, social responsibility, customer

and market focus, resource and information management, supply and partner performance.

W-Smith closed his remarks with a comment on customer impact "... TQM presents obvious benefits. Bearing in mind that Gestetner is a highly integrated company, it is obvious that customers will feel the positive impact of measures taken to streamline processes within the company itself."

Measurement brings up feedbacks upon which corrective actions can be taken and achievement celebrated. Without measurement, it would have been impossible for Gestetner to assess its TQM efforts. Asher (1996, P47) says "measurement is the only way to plot progress on a path of improvement from the existing to the desired state of affairs."

Wilkins H. Robert's (1994, P133) popular statement "you can't manage what you don't measure" counts here. But how can one measure at all if a proper planned TQM programme is not set out at the onset based on well calculated quality improvement steps. Oakland (1989, P289) recognized Juran's 10 quality improvement steps as:

1. Build TQM awareness and its improvement benefits.
2. Set improvement goals.
3. Organize to achieve the set goals.
4. Provide education and training.
5. Implement problem solving projects.
6. Report progress
7. Give recognition
  
8. Communicate results
9. Keep score
10. Maintain momentum by constant system and process improvement.

The Church in Nigeria needs Juran's 10 quality improvement steps. If these are followed annually by deliberate actions, the Church will improve considerably in quality service offering. Performance measurement indicators will score higher, because all likely quality failure areas would have been discovered, attended to and positively changed within the year.

Employee trust is an aspect seldom measured. Litwin et al, 1968 said that trust as an important aspect of Climate can be measured through employee perceptions of an organization's supervision, goals and objectives, communication, interdepartmental cooperation, training and developmental programs, reward systems, employee commitment, respect for employees' skills.

Trust measurement is generally good for knowing how well the management is communicating with the employees and how much of the information is assimilated. It is also a determinant factor of how long the management can keep each employee and the extent of work value the company extracts from the employee. It is assumed that the level

of trust an employee develops with an organization will determine his level of dependence and performance.

2.1:12 Organizational Climate: This is understood as enduring characteristics of the organization that is reflected in the attitudes and descriptions employees make of the policies, practices and conditions that exist in the work environment (Schneider et al, 1975). Further, Schwartz et al (1981, P31) see climate "as a measure of whether people's expectations about what it should be like to work in an organization are being met."

Schein, 1985 said that climate can most accurately be understood as a manifestation of culture. Although Reichers et al, 1990 said culture is typically defined as a deeper, less consciously held set of meanings. Accordingly, measure of climate shows whether beliefs and expectations are being fulfilled, and may also offer valuable insights to whether and how an organization's culture will accommodate change.

Schwartz et al 1981, whose findings are applicable to TQM, said they found that a climate incompatible with the intended change can offer a strong level of resistance and even derail the most well planned change process. Positive climate is a strong factor for successful TQM implementation. Over the years, TQM has been globally embraced because of its theoretical promises. But outcome has not met expectations in some cases. Sadgrove (1995, P22) said "70% of all attempts fail.

A Gallup survey in the USA found that only 28% of firms had achieved significant results from their quality initiatives (where "significant" meant increasing profit or market share)." Erickson, 1992; Fuchsberg, 1992 and Kendrick, 1993 were quoted as saying (in an article on the internet) that "recent evidence suggests that attempts to implement it are often unsuccessful."

Wyatt, a human resources consulting firm, surveyed 531 companies that had undergone restructuring in 1992. Only 41% of the 361 companies that started TQM programmes as a part of restructuring considered them to have been effective (Fuchsberg, 1993).

Similarly, (Doyle, 1992) reported that a study by McKinsey and co, revealed that of TQM programmes in place for more than two years, as many as two thirds are considered failures by the employees.

The question is this, what is making them fail? Some researchers listed below have attributed the high rate of failure to certain implementation deficiencies such as organizational commitment, reward system, shared vision, empowerment, etc - Brown et al, 1994; Danjin et al, 1992; Doyle, 1992; Emery et al, 1992 & Gilbert, 1993). Several other studies done by Bright et al, 1993, Glover, 1993, Morris, 1994 and Westbrook, 1993 indicated that failure might be due to organizational inability to adopt a TQM- type culture; that is, a culture based on "living for the customer."

In a Tucows Inc. internet service recent publication, a research firm did a work to test the significance of "Climate" as a necessary precondition for TQM successful

implementation. Two hypothesis were tested.

a. Employee perceptions of organizational climate will be more favourable among employees within successful, as opposed to unsuccessful, TQM implementers.

b. Employee perceptions of their organizations will improve during TQM implementations. (The second hypothesis was based on literature review of the works of Lawler, 1994, Sullivan, 1992 and Detoro et al, 1992 which suggested that any management interventions to change participation and continuous improvement will improve organization climate.

The results were the following in short summary.

a. Prior to TQM implementation, employee perceptions of organizational climate were more favourable within TQM successful organizations than the unsuccessful.

b. The findings suggested that organizational climate plays a significant role in the sustainability of TQM implementations.

c. The results provided support for the findings of Harber et al, (1993) and Counte et al, (1992) who found that climate improved following TQM implementations.

For the Church in Nigeria, the climate has got to be right as much as possible. A climate permeated with the love of God at all times is the answer. Love is hard to reject. No one rejects love just as no one rejects honey. Wherever the true love of God is in practice, people will run there and stay there. This is a great lesson for the Church in Nigeria. To show love is to have the people. And to have the people for God's Glory is Divine goal. A favourable climate of practical love makes this possible whichever way one looks at it.

2.1:13 Lean Production: This is also a Japanese developed method of Total Quality Management. It involves multiskilling, teamwork and lean design. Multiskilling is a form of employee empowerment in that it allows the employee to acquire various skills in many areas which make him more useful, more practical in more than one area of production.

How useful this will be in the Church, especially in the choir if the musicians can be trained to each play more than one musical instrument. The shortage of skills that occasionally occur during services will no more be there. Prokopenko et al (1996, P9-11) pointed to another important feature of lean production which is called (JIT) - Just-in-time delivery of supplies (parts, raw materials, etc.). JIT calls for precise scheduling and very high levels of quality. It reduces the amount of money tied up in stock and eliminates provision for large storage facilities.

2.1.14 Teamwork: Besterfield (1995, P62) defined a team "as a group of people working together to achieve common goals and objectives." Teams do succeed because of the emphasis placed on people. Besterfield felt because team development has gone through many stages, it has finally arrived at the point of total acceptability and good usefulness. Team developmental stages over the years have been four in number.

1. Forming: The Exploration period for the team.
2. Storming: The age of rivals within team
3. Norming: The age of harmonious team relationship
4. Performing: The age of effective decision making.

The level of education, enlightenment, globalization of different human knowledge exposures have helped in bringing team concept into proper usefulness. Teams do help a lot in decision making by contributing valid suggestions. In the Church, teams have different names from cells, committees, specially branded groups to house fellowships.

Oakland (1989, P236) stated five reasons why teamwork is needed in quality management. The reasons are equally applicable for teamwork in the Church.

1. Problem solving beyond the capacity of one person
2. Diversity of knowledge, skill and experience for problem solving.
3. Morale boosting for team members
4. Cross functional boundaries can be dealt with easily.
5. Team recommendations get attended to faster than individuals.

The Church needs teamwork in many areas for it to function effectively. Areas such as preaching needs teamwork; while the Pastor is preparing to preach, when he is actually preaching and after preaching, he needs the supporting prayers of his members (some times called prayer group or prayer warriors).

In Church physical structure building, teamwork is needed to finance, plan and actually build. Members do support with physical labour. Evangelism is another area where massive teamwork is required. Jesus said “Go ye into the world and preach the Gospel to every creature.” Mark 16:15. The instruction is not only to the Pastors but to all believers in Him. Pastors cannot and should not handle this alone.

2.1:15 Lean Design is a system that works through teamwork by using brainstorming techniques in each organization’s section and across function.

It garners various ideas and opinions which when properly harnessed bring about better design ideas, better quality and better products. Idea generation through groups has been discovered to be faster and cheaper which in turn reduces production cost.

2.1:16 Loss Function: Besterfield et al (1995, P351) referred to Dr. Taguchi, a mechanical engineer who has won four Deming Awards as the originator of loss function concept. Taguchi defines loss function as the loss imparted to society from the time a product leaves the manufacturer. The societal losses include failure to meet customer requirements, ideal performance and harmful side effects.

Contrary to Taguchi’s view which sees “loss function” from the angle of production, I see it from the marketing point of view. Products should not be seen as acceptable simply because they meet specification limits. Why?

Because specification limits arrived at by a manufacturing unit may not necessarily mean all the specification limits available to a product. Another manufacturer who sets higher specification limits is likely to come up with better products and better product performance in the same product class. The loss function from the marketing point of view therefore can then be defined as less than possible quality available to a product being achieved through the setting of lower specification limits.

To reduce the loss function of a product, specification limits should therefore no longer be the production targets; never ending improvement should be the target and must never cease.

2.1:17 Selected Suppliers: This is a Japanese TQM technique also. A useful means of getting very close to suppliers directly and to customers indirectly. To foster a cordial buyer/supplier relationship, the Japanese use techniques such as careful supplier sourcing, inspection, selection, training, rating, certification, recognition and award.

Besterfield et al (1995, P94). The system works through hand picking of most reliable suppliers which enables an organization to manage them well because they are few in member. The organization is also able to control quality right from the source of supply. This method allows for accurate control of supplies to very exact specifications through dialogue. In the end, exact intended quality level for a product is achieved.

2.1:18 The benefits of TQM: Kit Sadgrove (1995) and Prokopenko et al (1996) projected the benefits of TQM in two generic ways. Its involvement benefits the organization itself and its benefits upon the people involved with it directly or indirectly within and without the organization.

Its organizational involvement benefits are many. If the organization succeeds, it makes it a leader. The organization enjoys teamwork. It becomes more sensitive to its customers. It changes the organization's orientation climate and corporate attitude to customers. It fosters unity among the employees within the organization through continuous interactions. All these corporate benefits are needed badly by the Church in Nigeria. The Church has to achieve these before it can be seen as having taken properly, its God given position in the society as in Matthew 5:13 and 14 – "You are the salt of the earth..." "You are the light of the world. A city that is set on a hill cannot be hidden."

The customers within, that is, the employees benefit from TQM. Outside the organization are external customers, the shareholders and the larger society. All benefit from TQM.

When organizations apply the TQM concept and succeed, employment is generated and sustained, crime rate reduces and wealth redistributed. The Church benefits from this indirectly and directly because Church members are employed who make a living on the successful organizations.

## CHAPTER THREE (RESEARCH METHODOLOGY)

3.1 Method of Data Collection: Three methods were used to collect data for this work. They were

1. Personal Field Interview
2. Questionnaire
3. Desk Research

**Research Group:** For the purpose of this work and to ensure that a thorough job was done, a research group was set up. The group had as members the author of this work (as chairman), three of his senior office staff (Banjo, Doris and Anthony) and an external research expert - Biodun Agbaje, a senior research analyst at Market Research Consultancy Ltd., Ikeja, Lagos, Nigeria.

**The Personal Field Interview:** This was used as a top management contact tool with few of the very outstanding Church founders and leaders; whose Church organizations were perceived to have implemented TQM in Nigeria. This was considered necessary, as the only way of getting their attention which forwarded questionnaires might not achieve.

Our purpose was that since these people were TQM implementation key decision makers in their different Churches, we would be able to get from them first hand vital TQM inside knowledge on the following issues.

1. Awareness, practice and stage.
2. Suitability of TQM for Church matters in Nigeria.
3. Implementation approach and processes.
4. Levels of success recorded so far.
5. What they think is responsible for their success.

**Questionnaire:** Well made out questionnaires were served to various Churches in Lagos, covering the three Church segments of Catholic, Protestant and Pentecostal.

**Desk Research:** The collection of the necessary desk research data was done by reviewing various scholarly works of many writers and professionals on Total Quality Management. The sources of the reference materials in this regard were:

1. Eko International Bank Library, Matori, Lagos
2. Electronic Library (elibrary.com) on the internet
3. Internet website (google.com)
4. CHRIST Success Books Library, Ikeja, Lagos.
5. British Council Library, Ikoyi, Lagos.
6. Other Books, journals and articles sourced from friends and organizations.

7. Bibles and books, from “Just Bibles”, Allen Avenue, Lagos.
8. Other internet sources such as : go to .com; findarticle.com; emerald-library.com; etc.

3.2 Investigation Sample: the Universe for this work was Nigeria. Lagos was selected as sample of study for the following reasons.

1. TQM implementation and practice decision is top management driven. Top managements of organizations are usually based at their headquarters, Church inclusive. Many Church Organizations in Nigeria have their headquarters in Lagos. It is therefore sensible to talk to their founders and leaders in Lagos. Above all most Church organizations are well represented in Lagos including those that their headquarters are not in Lagos.

2. Lagos is the commercial capital of Nigeria which in the past was the capital of Nigeria. These two major roles played by Lagos have attracted many people to settle there from every part of Nigeria.

3. Nigerian tribes, culture and languages with Christianity inclination are well represented in Lagos.

4. Because most Church headquarters are based in Lagos, decisions affecting Church management nationally are made and passed down from Lagos.

5. Lagos houses the national headquarters of CAN - Christian Association of Nigeria. The Body placed in charge of all Christian organizations in Nigeria. It is affiliated to the World Council of Churches.

6. The concentration of foreigners who are Christians is more in Lagos than other parts of Nigeria. Since Christian foreigners attend Nigerian Churches and are part of us while they are here, we were mindful to include them in the survey.

Sample Composition: For a good level of representation, the three sectors of the Church in Nigeria namely Catholic, Protestant and Pentecostal were sufficiently covered. In each Church, four questionnaires were distributed randomly covering the pastor, ministers working under him, Church full time workers, Church officers (e.g. elder, deacon, deaconess, etc).

The reason why the questionnaires were aimed at all cadres of people in each Church is because TQM by nature calls for the involvement of all in an organization (teamwork) before it can be successful. David Iornem (1998, P127), “the word total is used to emphasize the fact that everybody in the organization, all levels, all departments and every activity is to be ruled by the TQM approach.” Without the collective effort and contributions of all in an organization; TQM will not succeed no matter the level of management commitment to it.

3.3 Data Analysis Method: The objectives and the nature of this study demand that Frequency Percentages be adopted and used to statistically analyze the findings. This approach we believe will give good level of accuracy of judgments - considering the fact that the universe was aptly represented, the sample well covered and the respondents well spread.

## CHAPTER FOUR

4. Data Presentation and Analysis: Data are presented and analyzed in the following order.

4.1 General Data Overview

4.2 Testing the hypotheses in relation to the questionnaires.

4.3 Assessing the methods of implementation employed by Church organizations that have implemented TQM in Nigeria.

4.4 Assessing the success levels after implementation.

4.5 Pin-pointing the reasons for success.

4.6 Assessing the practice climate in relation to success.

4.7 Presentation of all Data Tables in General.

Sticking to points stated above with a complete focus on the realization of the objectives of this research, the data presentation, analysis, discussions and conclusions will focus mainly on the Church organizations that have heard, have understood, have implemented TQM and have succeeded in doing so in Nigeria.

4.1 General Data overview: A total of 110 different Church organizations were contacted, each served with 4 questionnaires. A total of 440 questionnaires were distributed. The return rate was 53% which stood for 233 questionnaires.

This return rate was considered good enough because of its proper spread, coverage and representation. Out of 110 different Churches contacted, 87 of them (i.e.79%) responded (see list of Churches interviewed on page 137 for details). 16 respondents out of those served questionnaires did not collect the questionnaires at all, talk less of reading and filling them because they felt Christianity had nothing to do with such a study (anathema). They stood at 4% of the total questionnaires distributed, thus not significant. A total of 19 Churches collected the questionnaires but later returned them untouched without stating any reasons at all for doing so. They stood at 17%, of total questionnaires distributed. This also is not significant because on the overall, its effect is not tangible. And more over, the Churches in this group all fell into the Pentecostal Church sector which already has more than enough representation in the overall responses (Tables on page 137 refer). On the whole we are confident that a good work was done and the outcome quite reliable.

4.2a Hypothesis I: That many Church organizations in Nigeria have not heard of Total Quality Management concept. This hypothesis was tested by the number of respondents

who had heard of TQM and understood its principles. Pastors and members, both alike inclusive.

Specific Data Table 1  
 AWARENESS OF  
 TQM – PART 3 Q1  
 (Have you heard of TQM?)  
 BASE: TOTAL QUESTIONNAIRES RETURNED

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====

	Total	MALE	FEMALE	CATH	PROTE	PENTE	PASTOR	MEM
	OLICS	STANTS	COSTAL	BERS				

-----

Total 233 152 81 13 36 184 56 177

YES 107 74 33 1 1 105 42 65  
 46% 49% 41% 8% 3% 57% 75% 37%

NO 126 78 48 12 35 79 14 112  
 54% 51% 59% 92% 97% 43% 25% 63%

Analysis: A total of 107 respondents (46%) out of 233 who filled the questionnaires said in clear terms that they had heard about TQM. That is the term Total Quality Management was not new to their hearing. That led us to probe further as shown in the next table.

Specific Data Table 2  
 AWARENESS OF TQM-PART 3 Q2  
 (Are you aware of its Principles?)  
 BASE: THOSE HEARD OF TQM ALREADY  
 SEX

CHURCHES POSITION  
 Total MALE FEMALE CATH PROTE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
 OLICS STANTS COSTAL BERS

==== =====

-----

Total 107 74 33 1 1 105 42 65

YES 8 7 1 1 - 7 6 2  
 7% 9% 3% 100% 0% 7% 14% 3%

NO 82 56 26 - - 82 32 50

77% 76% 79% 0% 0% 78% 76% 77%

DON'T KNOW 17 11 6 - 1 16 4 13  
16% 15% 18% 0% 100% 15% 10% 20%

Analysis: 7% of those (107) respondents who had heard about TQM said they knew about its principles. A whopping 77% (82) said though they had heard about TQM, they knew nothing about its principles. 16% (17 respondents out of 107) declined with “don’t know.” Hypothesis I is validated that many Church organizations in Nigeria have not heard about TQM. And even 77% of the very few that had heard knew nothing about its principles.

4.2b Hypothesis II: That the few Church Organizations in Nigeria that know of TQM have implemented it. This hypothesis answered to the number of Churches that had implemented TQM among the ones which had understood its principles in addition to their knowing of its concept.

Specific Data Table 3  
IMPLEMENTATION –PART3 Q5  
(Does your Church practice TQM?)  
Base: THOSE AWARE OF TQM PRINCIPLES

POSITION  
===== ===== CHURCHES  
Total PAS MEM CATH PROTE PENTE  
TORS BERS OLICS STANTS COSTAL  
-----  
-----  
Total 8 6 2 1 - 7

YES 5 3 2 - - 5  
63% 50% 100% 0% 0% 71%

NO 3 3 - 1 - 2  
37% 50% 0% 100% 0% 29%

Analysis: Out of 8 respondents who were aware of TQM principles only 5, 3 pastors and 2 members (all Pentecostal said, their Churches practiced TQM. 102 respondents (95%) out of 107 who had heard about TQM said it was not being practiced in their Churches. This 95% included 39 pastors and 63 members. The hypothesis that the few Churches in Nigeria that know about TQM have implemented it is therefore validated.

4.2c Hypothesis III: That the Churches which have implemented TQM in Nigeria do not have a deep knowledge of it. This was tested by crucial TQM deep knowledge factors contained in the questionnaires such as:

- Clarity of Goals and objectives
- Understanding of TQM Principles
- Usage of quality improvement service department
- Usage of members' skills
- Readiness to change process
- Continuous and all encompassing quality practice
- Constant two way communications.

These are believed to be the core issues that indicate the level of deep TQM knowledge and practice in any organization to an acceptable degree.

Specific Data Table 4

DEEP TQM KNOWLEDGE:PART 5A Q8

(Clarity of Church goals & objectives ?)

Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM  
POSITION

=====

Total PAS MEM

TORS BERS

-----

Total 5 3 2

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1

40% 33% 50%

AVERAGE (3.0) 3 2 1

60% 67% 50%

Medians 3 3 3.5

Minimum 4 4 4

Maximum 3 3 3

Mode 3 3 -

Mean score 3.4 3.33 3.5

Standard error 0.24 0.33 0.5

Analysis: The five respondents representing the few Churches that practiced TQM in Nigeria said Church goals and objectives were understood. 40% saw the level of goals clarity to be "Above Average" while 60% saw it as "Average." However, no one saw goals and objective clarity falling below average.

Specific Data Table 5

DEEP TQM KNOWLEDGE:PART 3 Q2

(Are you aware of TQM principles?)

Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM

POSITION

=====

Total PAS MEM  
TORS BERS

-----

Total 5 3 2

YES 5 3 2

100% 100% 100%

Analysis: All the 5 respondents whose Churches practiced TQM were expectedly aware of its principles. (Three Pastors, two members).

Specific Data Table 6

DEEP TQM KNOWLEDGE:PART 3 Q8

(Quality service dept. in Church?)

Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM

POSITION

=====

Total PAS MEM  
TORS BERS

-----

Total 5 3 2

YES 5 3 2

100% 100% 100%

Specific Data Table 7

DEEP TQM KNOWLEDGE:PART 3 Q10

(Service performance monitoring

group in Church?)

Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM

POSITION

=====

Total PAS MEM  
TORS BERS

Total 5 3 2

YES 5 3 2  
100% 100% 100%

Analysis: Usage of service quality improvement department in Church was consented to by the five respondents. Research executives got curious and probed further verbally to know how this was being done?

The reply which came from pastors only was that appointed groups for various service sectors in Church were used as improvement departments in that each group was empowered to discuss issues and processes and make recommendations to Church leadership from time to time.

Specific Data Table 8  
DEEP TQM KNOWLEDGE:PART 5A Q6  
(Usage of members' skills in Church?)  
Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM  
POSITION

===== =====  
Total PAS MEM  
TORS BERS  
----- -----

Total 5 3 2

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1  
40% 33% 50%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 -  
40% 67% 0%

BELOW AVERAGE (2.0) 1 - 1  
20% 0% 50%

Medians 3 3 3

Minimum 4 4 4

Maximum 2 3 2

Mode - 3 -

Mean score 3.2 3.33 3

Standard error 0.37 0.33 1

Analysis: Usage of members' skills in Church was rated 40% Above Average, 40% Average, 20% Below Average @ 2, 2 & 1 person(s) respectively. At the median score of 3 over 5, a good score was recorded as usage of members skills. This was considered by us as acceptable.

Specific Data Table 9  
DEEP TQM KNOWLEDGE:PART 3 Q11  
(Service process change due to

peoples' demand?)  
Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM  
POSITION

=====  
Total PAS MEM  
TORS BERS  
-----

Total 5 3 2

YES 5 3 2  
100% 100% 100%

Analysis: Readiness to change service process on continuous basis was observed to be the norm for all respondents whose Churches practiced TQM.

Specific Data Table 11  
DEEP TQM KNOWLEDGE:PART 5B Q10  
(All round Quality application in Church?)  
Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM  
POSITION

=====  
Total PAS MEM  
TORS BERS  
-----

Total 5 3 2

YES 4 3 1  
80% 100% 50%

NO 1 - 1  
20% 0% 50%

Analysis: Continuous and all encompassing quality application in Church was adjudged 80% by all the pastor respondents and one member. A member (expectedly seen as in better position to judge this issue more accurately than pastors) said all encompassing quality was not yet in place. This respondent felt that though TQM was in place in his Church, all areas of Church affairs were not yet involved.

Specific Data Table 12  
DEEP TQM KNOWLEDGE:PART 5A Q9  
(Willingness of members to reveal  
problems in Church?)  
Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM  
POSITION

=====  
Total PAS MEM  
TORS BERS  
-----

Total 5 3 2

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1  
40% 33% 50%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 -  
40% 67% 0%

BELOW AVERAGE (2.0) 1 - 1  
20% 0% 50%  
Medians 3 3 3  
Minimum 4 4 4  
Maximum 2 3 2  
Mode - 3 -  
Mean score 3.2 3.33 3  
Standard error 0.37 0.33 1

Specific Data Table 13  
DEEP TQM KNOWLEDGE:PART 5A Q10  
(Willingness of leaders to listen  
to problems and take action?)  
Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM  
POSITION

=====  
Total PAS MEM  
TORS BERS  
-----

Total 5 3 2

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1  
40% 33% 50%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 -  
40% 67% 0%

BELOW AVERAGE (2.0) 1 - 1  
20% 0% 50%  
Medians 3 3 3  
Minimum 4 4 4  
Maximum 2 3 2  
Mode - 3 -

Mean score 3.2 3.33 3  
Standard error 0.37 0.33 1

Analysis: The practice of two way communications especially in problem solving was noticed as very strong in Churches that practiced TQM in Nigeria. Pastor respondents judged the rate of members' readiness to reveal problems as 80% ranging between Average and Above Average. Member respondents also judged Pastors' (i.e. the Church) readiness to listen and take action at the same level. All put together, the hypothesis that Churches in Nigeria that practice TQM have no deep knowledge of it is proved wrong. 4.2d Hypothesis IV: That the Church in Nigeria sees TQM as anathema if applied to the things of God. This hypothesis was tested based on two factors.

A. The opinion of those who know TQM Principles as related to this matter. Because only they can give us intelligent clues. Those who have not heard about TQM nor know its principles can not.

B. The Number of those who rejected the questionnaires out rightly due to anathema reasons.

Specific Data Table 14  
ANATHEMA-PART 3 Q4  
(TQM principles good & applicable  
to Church Management in Nigeria?)  
BASE: THOSE AWARE OF TQM PRINCIPLES  
POSITION

===== =====  
Total PAS MEM  
TORS BERS  
-----

Total 8 6 2

YES 8 6 2  
100% 100% 100%

Analysis: The eight respondents who knew TQM and its principles all said the principles were good for Church management in Nigeria. Sixteen respondents (4% of total number of questionnaires served) rejected questionnaires outrightly on the premise of anathema. (the 4% was quite insignificant). These facts invalidate the hypothesis number four. Infact, the Church in Nigeria by this outcome sees TQM as good and applicable to the things of God.

4.3 Assessing the implementation METHODS used by the Churches that have implemented TQM in Nigeria.

Specific Data Table 15

TQM IMPLEMENTATION METHODS - PART 4 Q1 to 4  
 Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

===== ===== ===== ===== =====  
 Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
 COSTAL BERS  
 -----

Total 5 4 1 5 3 2

DISSEMINATION  
 OF KNOWLEDGE  
 OF QUALITY FROM  
 THE HEAD DOWN TO GROUP  
 LEADERS, INDIVIDUALS  
 BY CONSTANT TRAINING,  
 TEACHING AND PRACTICE 2 1 1 2 1 1  
 40% 25% 100% 40% 33% 50%  
 LEADERSHIP COMITMENT AND  
 PRACTICE OF TQM WHICH  
 NATURALLY RUBS DOWN  
 ON MEMBERS IN THE CHURCH 1 1 - 1 1 -  
 20% 25% 0% 20% 33% 0%

DEPENDENCE ON THE  
 HOLY GHOST,THE WORD AND  
 INVITED GUEST SPEAKERS  
 WHO TEACH IN THE  
 CHURCH FROM TIME TO TIME 5 4 1 5 3 2  
 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 100%

Analysis: The table above clearly depicts Church respect for God as the All in All. It is a case of “The One above, is above all.” All respondents unanimously said that their first implementation method was their total dependence on The Holy Ghost (a very crucial factor for Church success in all areas, TQM inclusive). Backed by constant training of workers and members through invited speakers. This method was scored 100% by all the respondents who practiced TQM.

That was followed by the method of knowledge dissemination from leader to group leaders to individuals, backed up by constant training and practice (40%). Only one respondent (male) said the method in his Church was leadership practice and commitment to TQM which naturally rubbed down on members. That was of course in addition to total dependence on the Holy Spirit already scored 100% by all respondents.

No Church consented to the use of hired TQM consultants, as the practice is with companies. And no Church consented to the use of Quality Groups deliberately set up and saddled with TQM corporate responsibilities.

#### 4.4 Assessing the Success Levels

Specific Data Table 16  
 ASSESSING SUCCESS/FAILURE OF TQM  
 PART 6 Q1 to 4 (Very Successful to Don't Know?)  
 Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM

##### SEX CHURCHES POSITION

==== =====  
 Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
 COSTAL BERS

-----  
 Total 5 4 1 5 3 2

VERY SUCCESSFUL 3 2 1 3 2 1  
 60% 50% 100% 60% 67% 50%

SUCCESSFUL 1 1 - 1 1 -  
 20% 25% 0% 20% 33% 0%

UNSUCCESSFUL 1 1 - 1 - 1  
 20% 25% 0% 20% 0% 50%

Analysis: According to this table, three levels of outcome were recorded by the few Churches that practiced TQM in Nigeria. 60% said it was very successful to them. 20% rated the level of success as just "successful." 20%, which represented one person felt it was not successful. In all, 80% of respondents judged their practice of TQM as successful. The 80% included 3 pastors and one member.

#### 4.5 Pin-pointing the reasons for Success

Specific Data Table 17  
 REASONS FOR SUCCESS OF TQM  
 (Part 7 Q1 to 7)  
 Base: Those said TQM was successful

##### SEX CHURCHES POSITION

==== =====  
 Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
 COSTAL BERS

-----  
 Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

A LEADER CALLED  
BY GOD WITH A CLEAR  
VISION WHICH ARE WELL  
COMMUNICATED TO MEMBERS 1 1 - 1 1 -  
25% 33% 0% 25% 33% 0%

CONSIDERATION  
OF PEOPLE AS  
FIRST AFTER GOD AS MAIN  
TARGET OF SERVICE 1 1 - 1 1 -  
25% 33% 0% 25% 33% 0%  
TOTAL LEADERSHIP  
AND FOLLOWERSHIP  
COMMITMENT AND  
DOGGEDNESS TO QUALITY  
IN REALIZATION OF COMMON  
GOAL, VISION AND MISSION 1 1 - 1 1 -  
25% 33% 0% 25% 33% 0%

EFFECTIVE AND  
CONSTANT TRAINING  
OF CHURCH PEOPLE AND  
WORKERS REGULARLY  
WHICH IS IN PLACE 1 1 - 1 1 -  
25% 33% 0% 25% 33% 0%

CONSTANT PRACTICE OF TWO  
WAY COMMUNICATION METHODS 1 1 - 1 1 -  
25% 33% 0% 25% 33% 0%

ALL OF THE ABOVE 3 2 1 3 2 1  
75% 67% 100% 75% 67% 100%

Analysis: 75% of respondents who said TQM was successful unanimously gave the following reasons for its success in their Churches. Ironically, the 25% respondent who said it was not successful did not seem to have some or all the reasons in practice in the Church.

- a. Leader called by God with clear purpose and vision well communicated to members.
- b. Consideration of people as main target of service in Church.
- c. All encompassing leadership/followership commitment to Quality.
- d. Effective and constant training of Church workers and members.
- e. Constant practice of two way communication methods.

4.6 Assessing the practice climate in relation to success

Specific Data Table 18

CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A: Q1

(Commitment of members to success of the Church?)

Base: Those said TQM was successful

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====

Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
COSTAL BERS

-----

Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

EXCELLENT (5.0) 1 1 - 1 1 -  
25% 33% 0% 25% 33% 0%

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1  
50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 1 1 - 1 1 -  
25% 33% 0% 25% 33% 0%

Medians 4 4 4 4 4 4

Minimum 5 5 4 5 5 4

Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4

Mode 4 - 4 4 - 4

Mean score 4 4 4 4 4 4

Standard error 0.41 0.58 - 0.41 0.58 -

Specific Data Table 19

CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A:Q2

(Level of respect of members to leadership and vice versa?)

Base: Those said TQM was successful

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====

Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
COSTAL BERS

-----

Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1

50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -

50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%

Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4

Minimum 4 4 4 4 4 4

Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4

Mode - 3 4 - 3 4

Mean score 3.5 3.33 4 3.5 3.33 4

Standard error 0.29 0.33 - 0.29 0.33 -

Specific Data Table 20

CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A: Q3

(Level of respect from members to members?)

Base: Those said TQM was successful

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====

Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
COSTAL BERS

-----

Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1

50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -

50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%

Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4

Minimum 4 4 4 4 4 4

Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4

Mode - 3 4 - 3 4

Mean score 3.5 3.33 4 3.5 3.33 4

Standard error 0.29 0.33 - 0.29 0.33 -

Specific Data Table 21

CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A:Q4

(Level of members togetherness and co-operation in the Church?)

Base: Those said TQM was successful

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====

Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
COSTAL BERS

-----

Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

EXCELLENT (5.0) 1 1 - 1 1 -  
25% 33% 0% 25% 33% 0%

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 1 - 1 1 - 1  
25% 0% 100% 25% 0% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%

Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4

Minimum 5 5 4 5 5 4

Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4

Mode 3 3 4 3 3 4

Mean score 3.75 3.67 4 3.75 3.67 4

Standard error 0.48 0.67 - 0.48 0.67 -

Specific Data Table 22

CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A:Q5  
(Quality of training and development offered by the Church?)

Base: Those said TQM was successful

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====

Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
COSTAL BERS

-----

Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1  
50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%

Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4

Minimum 4 4 4 4 4 4

Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4

Mode - 3 4 - 3 4

Mean score 3.5 3.33 4 3.5 3.33 4  
Standard error 0.29 0.33 - 0.29 0.33 -

Specific Data Table 23  
CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A: Q6  
(Usage of members' skills for the things of God by the Church?)  
Base: Those said TQM was successful

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====

Total	MALE	FEMALE	PENTE	PASTOR	MEM
-------	------	--------	-------	--------	-----

COSTAL BERS

-----

Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1  
50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%  
Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4  
Minimum 4 4 4 4 4 4  
Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4  
Mode - 3 4 - 3 4

Mean score 3.5 3.33 4 3.5 3.33 4  
Standard error 0.29 0.33 - 0.29 0.33 -

Specific Data Table 24  
CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A: Q7  
(The quality of direct supervision by the Church?)  
Base: Those said TQM was successful

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====

Total	MALE	FEMALE	PENTE	PASTOR	MEM
-------	------	--------	-------	--------	-----

COSTAL BERS

-----

Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1  
50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%  
Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4  
Minimum 4 4 4 4 4 4  
Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4  
Mode - 3 4 - 3 4

Mean score 3.5 3.33 4 3.5 3.33 4  
Standard error 0.29 0.33 - 0.29 0.33 -

Specific Data Table 25  
CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A: Q8  
(The clarity of Church goals and objectives?)  
Base: Those said TQM was successful

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====  
Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
COSTAL BERS  
-----

Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1  
50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%  
Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4  
Minimum 4 4 4 4 4 4  
Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4  
Mode - 3 4 - 3 4

Mean score 3.5 3.33 4 3.5 3.33 4  
Standard error 0.29 0.33 - 0.29 0.33 -

Specific Data Table 26  
CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A: Q9  
(The willingness of members to reveal problems?)

Base: Those said TQM was successful

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====  
Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
COSTAL BERS  
-----

Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1  
50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%  
Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4  
Minimum 4 4 4 4 4 4  
Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4  
Mode - 3 4 - 3 4

Mean score 3.5 3.33 4 3.5 3.33 4  
Standard error 0.29 0.33 - 0.29 0.33 -

Specific Data Table 27

CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A:Q10

(The willingness of leaders to listen and take action?)

Base: Those said TQM was successful

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====  
Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
COSTAL BERS  
-----

Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1  
50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%  
Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4  
Minimum 4 4 4 4 4 4  
Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4  
Mode - 3 4 - 3 4

Mean score 3.5 3.33 4 3.5 3.33 4  
Standard error 0.29 0.33 - 0.29 0.33 -

Specific Data Table 28  
CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A:Q11  
(The willingness of members to obey and apply Church policies?)  
Base: Those said TQM was successful

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

===== ===== ===== ===== =====  
Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
COSTAL BERS

-----  
Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

EXCELLENT (5.0) 1 1 - 1 1 -  
25% 33% 0% 25% 33% 0%

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 1 - 1 1 - 1  
25% 0% 100% 25% 0% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%

Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4  
Minimum 5 5 4 5 5 4  
Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4  
Mode 3 3 4 3 3 4

Mean score 3.75 3.67 4 3.75 3.67 4  
Standard error 0.48 0.67 - 0.48 0.67 -

Specific Data Table 29  
CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A:Q12  
(Reward by God for good and obedient performances  
as can be seen in the lives of members?)  
Base: Those said TQM was successful

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

===== ===== ===== ===== =====  
Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
COSTAL BERS

-----  
Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1  
50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%  
Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4  
Minimum 4 4 4 4 4 4  
Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4  
Mode - 3 4 - 3 4

Mean score 3.5 3.33 4 3.5 3.33 4  
Standard error 0.29 0.33 - 0.29 0.33 -

Analysis: Conducive climate contributed immensely to the success of TQM in Churches where it had been implemented in Nigeria. Climate factors which were well rated by respondents (in most cases above average) included commitment of both the leadership and followership to quality; high level of respect between members and between members and leadership; togetherness; high level of constant training and usage of members' skills; quality supervision and clarity of goals; two way communications; willingness of members to obey GOD and tangible rewards by God noticeable in the lives of members physically.

#### 4.7 Presentation of all Data Tables in General.

Specific Data Table 1  
AWARENESS OF TQM-PART 3 Q1  
(Have you heard of TQM?)  
BASE: TOTAL QUESTIONNAIRES RETURNED

#### SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====  
Total MALE FEMALE CATH PROTE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
OLICS STANTS COSTAL BERS

-----  
Total 233 152 81 13 36 184 56 177

YES 107 74 33 1 1 105 42 65  
46% 49% 41% 8% 3% 57% 75% 37%

NO 126 78 48 12 35 79 14 112  
54% 51% 59% 92% 97% 43% 25% 63%

Specific Data

Table 2

AWARENESS OF TQM-PART 3 Q2

(Are you aware of its Principles?)

BASE: THOSE HEARD OF TQM ALREADY

SEX

CHURCHES POSITION

Total MALE FEMALE CATH PROTE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
OLICS STANTS COSTAL BERS

==== == ===== ===== ===== ===== =====  
-----

Total 107 74 33 1 1 105 42 65

YES 8 7 1 1 - 7 6 2

7% 9% 3% 100% 0% 7% 14% 3%

NO 82 56 26 - - 82 32 50

77% 76% 79% 0% 0% 78% 76% 77%

DON'T KNOW 17 11 6 - 1 16 4 13

16% 15% 18% 0% 100% 15% 10% 20%

Specific Data Table 3

IMPLEMENTATION -PART3 Q5

(Does your Church practice TQM?)

Base: THOSE AWARE OF TQM PRINCIPLES

POSITION

===== =====

CHURCHES

Total PAS MEM CATH PROTE PENTE

TORS BERS OLICS STANTS COSTAL

----- ===== ===== =====  
-----

Total 8 6 2 1 - 7

YES 5 3 2 - - 5

63% 50% 100% 0% 0% 71%

NO 3 3 - 1 - 2  
37% 50% 0% 100% 0% 29%

Specific Data Table 4  
DEEP TQM KNOWLEDGE:PART 5A Q8  
(Clarity of Church goals & objectives ?)  
Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM  
POSITION

=====

Total PAS MEM					
TORS BERS					

-----

Total 5 3 2

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1  
40% 33% 50%

AVERAGE (3.0) 3 2 1  
60% 67% 50%  
Medians 3 3 3.5  
Minimum 4 4 4  
Maximum 3 3 3  
Mode 3 3 -

Mean score 3.4 3.33 3.5  
Standard error 0.24 0.33 0.5

Specific Data Table 5  
DEEP TQM KNOWLEDGE:PART 3 Q2  
(Are you aware of TQM principles?)  
Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM  
POSITION

=====

Total PAS MEM					
TORS BERS					

-----

Total 5 3 2

YES 5 3 2  
100% 100% 100%

Specific Data Table 6  
DEEP TQM KNOWLEDGE:PART 3 Q8  
(Quality service dept in Church?)  
Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM  
POSITION

=====

Total PAS MEM  
TORS BERS

-----

Total 5 3 2

NO 5 3 2  
100% 100% 100%

Specific Data Table 7  
DEEP TQM KNOWLEDGE:PART 3 Q10  
(Service performance monitoring  
group in Church?)  
Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM  
POSITION

=====

Total PAS MEM  
TORS BERS

-----

Total 5 3 2

NO 5 3 2  
100% 100% 100%

Specific Data Table 8  
DEEP TQM KNOWLEDGE:PART 5A Q6

(Usage of members' skills in Church?)  
Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM  
POSITION

=====

Total PAS MEM  
TORS BERS

-----

Total 5 3 2

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1  
40% 33% 50%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 -  
40% 67% 0%

BELOW AVERAGE (2.0) 1 - 1  
20% 0% 50%

Medians 3 3 3

Minimum 4 4 4

Maximum 2 3 2

Mode - 3 -

Mean score 3.2 3.33 3

Standard error 0.37 0.33 1

Specific Data Table 9  
DEEP TQM KNOWLEDGE:PART 3 Q11  
(Service process change due to  
peoples' demand?)  
Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM  
POSITION

=====

Total PAS MEM  
TORS BERS

-----

Total 5 3 2

YES 5 3 2  
100% 100% 100%

Specific Data Table 10  
DEEP TQM KNOWLEDGE:PART 5B Q1

(People as main focus of service  
in Church after God?)  
Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM  
POSITION

=====

Total PAS MEM  
TORS BERS

-----

Total 5 3 2

YES 5 3 2  
100% 100% 100%

Specific Data Table 11  
DEEP TQM KNOWLEDGE:PART 5B Q10  
(All round Quality application in Church?)  
Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM  
POSITION

=====

Total PAS MEM  
TORS BERS

-----

Total 5 3 2

YES 4 3 1  
80% 100% 50%

NO 1 - 1  
20% 0% 50%

Specific Data Table 12  
DEEP TQM KNOWLEDGE:PART 5A Q9  
(Willingness of members to reveal  
problems in Church?)  
Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM  
POSITION

=====

Total PAS MEM  
TORS BERS

-----

Total 5 3 2

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1

40% 33% 50%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 -

40% 67% 0%

BELOW AVERAGE (2.0) 1 - 1

20% 0% 50%

Medians 3 3 3

Minimum 4 4 4

Maximum 2 3 2

Mode - 3 -

Mean score 3.2 3.33 3

Standard error 0.37 0.33 1

Specific Data Table 13

DEEP TQM KNOWLEDGE:PART 5A Q10

(Willingness of leaders to listen  
to problems and take action?)

Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM

POSITION

=====

Total PAS MEM

TORS BERS

-----

Total 5 3 2

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1

40% 33% 50%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 -

40% 67% 0%

BELOW AVERAGE (2.0) 1 - 1

20% 0% 50%

Medians 3 3 3

Minimum 4 4 4

Maximum 2 3 2

Mode - 3 -

Mean score 3.2 3.33 3

Standard error 0.37 0.33 1

Specific Data Table 14  
 ANATHEMA-PART 3 Q4  
 (TQM principles good & applicable  
 to Church Management in Nigeria?)  
 BASE:THOSE AWARE OF TQM PRINCIPLES  
 POSITION

=====

Total PAS MEM  
 TORS BERS

-----

Total 8 6 2

YES 8 6 2  
 100% 100% 100%

Specific Data Table 15  
 TQM IMPLEMENT METHODS - PART 4 Q1 - 4  
 Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====

Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
 COSTAL BERS

-----

Total 5 4 1 5 3 2

DISSEMINATION  
 OF KNOWLEDGE  
 OF QUALITY FROM  
 THE HEAD DOWN TO GROUP  
 LEADERS, INDIVIDUALS  
 BY CONSTANT TRAINING,  
 TEACHING AND PRACTICE 2 1 1 2 1 1  
 40% 25% 100% 40% 33% 50%  
 LEADERSHIP COMITMENT AND  
 PRACTICE OF TQM WHICH  
 NATURALLY RUBS DOWN  
 ON MEMBERS IN THE CHURCH 1 1 - 1 1 -  
 20% 25% 0% 20% 33% 0%

DEPENDENCE ON THE  
 HOLY GHOST,THE WORD AND

INVITED GUEST SPEAKERS  
 WHO TEACH IN THE  
 CHURCH FROM TIME TO TIME 5 4 1 5 3 2  
 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 100%

Specific Data Table 16  
 ASSESSING SUCCESS/FAILURE OF TQM  
 PART 6 Q1 – 4 (Very Successful – Don't know?)  
 Base: THOSE WHO PRACTICE TQM

SEX CHURCHES POSITION  
 =====  
 Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
 COSTAL BERS

-----  
 Total 5 4 1 5 3 2

VERY SUCCESSFUL 3 2 1 3 2 1  
 60% 50% 100% 60% 67% 50%

SUCCESSFUL 1 1 - 1 1 -  
 20% 25% 0% 20% 33% 0%

UNSUCCESSFUL 1 1 - 1 - 1  
 20% 25% 0% 20% 0% 50%

Specific Data Table 17  
 REASONS FOR SUCCESS OF TQM  
 (Part 7 Q1 – 7)  
 Base: THOSE SAID TQM IS SUCCESSFUL  
 SEX CHURCHES POSITION  
 =====  
 Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
 COSTAL BERS

-----  
 Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

A LEADER CALLED  
 BY GOD WITH A CLEAR  
 VISION WHICH ARE WELL  
 COMMUNICATED TO MEMBERS 1 1 - 1 1 -  
 25% 33% 0% 25% 33% 0%

CONSIDERATION

OF PEOPLE AS  
 FIRST AFTER GOD AS MAIN  
 TARGET OF OUR SERVICE 1 1 - 1 1 -  
 25% 33% 0% 25% 33% 0%  
 TOTAL LEADERSHIP  
 AND FOLLOWERSHIP  
 COMMITMENT AND  
 DOGGEDNESS TO QUALITY  
 IN REALIZATION OF COMMON  
 GOAL, VISION AND MISSION 1 1 - 1 1 -  
 25% 33% 0% 25% 33% 0%

EFFECTIVE AND  
 CONSTANT TRAINING  
 OF CHURCH PEOPLE AND  
 WORKERS REGULARLY  
 WHICH IS IN PLACE 1 1 - 1 1 -  
 25% 33% 0% 25% 33% 0%

CONSTANT PRACTICE OF TWO  
 WAY COMMUNICATION METHODS 1 1 - 1 1 -  
 25% 33% 0% 25% 33% 0%

ALL OF THE ABOVE 3 2 1 3 2 1  
 75% 67% 100% 75% 67% 100%

Specific Data Table 18  
 CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A: Q1  
 (Commitment of members to success of the Church?)  
 Base: THOSE SAID TQM IS SUCCESSFUL

SEX CHURCHES POSITION  
 =====  
 Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
 COSTAL BERS  
 -----

Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

EXCELLENT (5.0) 1 1 - 1 1 -  
 25% 33% 0% 25% 33% 0%

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1  
 50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 1 1 - 1 1 -  
 25% 33% 0% 25% 33% 0%  
 Medians 4 4 4 4 4 4  
 Minimum 5 5 4 5 5 4  
 Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4  
 Mode 4 - 4 4 - 4

Mean score 4 4 4 4 4 4  
 Standard error 0.41 0.58 - 0.41 0.58 -

Specific Data Table 19  
 CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A:Q2  
 (Level of respect of members to leadership and vice versa?)  
 Base: THOSE SAID TQM IS SUCCESSFUL

SEX CHURCHES POSITION  
 =====  
 Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
 COSTAL BERS  
 -----

Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1  
 50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
 50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%  
 Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4  
 Minimum 4 4 4 4 4 4  
 Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4  
 Mode - 3 4 - 3 4

Mean score 3.5 3.33 4 3.5 3.33 4  
 Standard error 0.29 0.33 - 0.29 0.33 -

Specific Data Table 20  
 CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A: Q3  
 (Level of respect from members to members?)  
 Base: THOSE SAID TQM IS SUCCESSFUL

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====  
Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
COSTAL BERS  
-----

Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1  
50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%  
Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4  
Minimum 4 4 4 4 4 4  
Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4  
Mode - 3 4 - 3 4

Mean score 3.5 3.33 4 3.5 3.33 4  
Standard error 0.29 0.33 - 0.29 0.33 -

Specific Data Table 21  
CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A:Q4  
(Level of members togetherness and co-operation in the Church?)  
Base: THOSE SAID TQM IS SUCCESSFUL

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====  
Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
COSTAL BERS  
-----

Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

EXCELLENT (5.0) 1 1 - 1 1 -  
25% 33% 0% 25% 33% 0%

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 1 - 1 1 - 1  
25% 0% 100% 25% 0% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%  
Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4  
Minimum 5 5 4 5 5 4  
Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4

Mode 3 3 4 3 3 4

Mean score 3.75 3.67 4 3.75 3.67 4  
Standard error 0.48 0.67 - 0.48 0.67 -

Specific Data Table 22  
CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A:Q5  
(Quality of training and development offered by the Church?)  
Base: THOSE SAID TQM IS SUCCESSFUL

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====

Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
COSTAL BERS

-----

Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1  
50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%

Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4

Minimum 4 4 4 4 4 4

Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4

Mode - 3 4 - 3 4

Mean score 3.5 3.33 4 3.5 3.33 4  
Standard error 0.29 0.33 - 0.29 0.33 -

Specific Data Table 23  
CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A: Q6  
(Usage of members' skills for the things of God by the Church?)  
Base: THOSE SAID TQM IS SUCCESSFUL

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====

Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
COSTAL BERS

-----

Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1  
50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%  
Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4  
Minimum 4 4 4 4 4 4  
Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4  
Mode - 3 4 - 3 4

Mean score 3.5 3.33 4 3.5 3.33 4  
Standard error 0.29 0.33 - 0.29 0.33 -

Specific Data Table 24

CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A: Q7

(The quality of direct supervision by the Church?)

Base: THOSE SAID TQM IS SUCCESSFUL

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====

Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
COSTAL BERS

-----

Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1  
50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%  
Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4  
Minimum 4 4 4 4 4 4  
Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4  
Mode - 3 4 - 3 4

Mean score 3.5 3.33 4 3.5 3.33 4  
Standard error 0.29 0.33 - 0.29 0.33 -

Specific Data Table 25

CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A: Q8

(The clarity of Church goals and objectives?)

Base: THOSE SAID TQM IS SUCCESSFUL

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====  
Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
COSTAL BERS

-----  
Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1  
50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%  
Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4  
Minimum 4 4 4 4 4 4  
Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4  
Mode - 3 4 - 3 4

Mean score 3.5 3.33 4 3.5 3.33 4  
Standard error 0.29 0.33 - 0.29 0.33 -

Specific Data Table 26

CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A: Q9

(The willingness of members to reveal problems?)

Base: THOSE SAID TQM IS SUCCESSFUL

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====  
Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
COSTAL BERS

-----  
Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1  
50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%  
Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4  
Minimum 4 4 4 4 4 4

Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4  
Mode - 3 4 - 3 4

Mean score 3.5 3.33 4 3.5 3.33 4  
Standard error 0.29 0.33 - 0.29 0.33 -

Specific Data Table 27  
CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A:Q10  
(The willingness of leaders to listen and take action?)  
Base: THOSE SAID TQM IS SUCCESSFUL

SEX CHURCHES POSITION  
=====

Total	MALE	FEMALE	PENTE	PASTOR	MEM
-------	------	--------	-------	--------	-----

COSTAL BERS  
-----

Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1  
50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%  
Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4  
Minimum 4 4 4 4 4 4  
Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4  
Mode - 3 4 - 3 4

Mean score 3.5 3.33 4 3.5 3.33 4  
Standard error 0.29 0.33 - 0.29 0.33 -

Specific Data Table 28  
CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A:Q11  
(The willingness of members to obey and apply Church policies?)  
Base: THOSE SAID TQM IS SUCCESSFUL

SEX CHURCHES POSITION  
=====

Total	MALE	FEMALE	PENTE	PASTOR	MEM
-------	------	--------	-------	--------	-----

COSTAL BERS  
-----

Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

EXCELLENT (5.0) 1 1 - 1 1 -  
25% 33% 0% 25% 33% 0%

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 1 - 1 1 - 1  
25% 0% 100% 25% 0% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%  
Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4  
Minimum 5 5 4 5 5 4  
Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4  
Mode 3 3 4 3 3 4

Mean score 3.75 3.67 4 3.75 3.67 4  
Standard error 0.48 0.67 - 0.48 0.67 -

Specific Data Table 29

CLIMATE CONTRIBUTION TO SUCCESS-PART 5A:Q12

(Reward by God for good and obedient performances  
as can be seen in the life of members?)

Base: THOSE SAID TQM IS SUCCESSFUL

SEX CHURCHES POSITION

=====

Total MALE FEMALE PENTE PASTOR MEM  
COSTAL BERS

-----  
Total 4 3 1 4 3 1

ABOVE AVERAGE (4.0) 2 1 1 2 1 1  
50% 33% 100% 50% 33% 100%

AVERAGE (3.0) 2 2 - 2 2 -  
50% 67% 0% 50% 67% 0%  
Medians 3.5 3 4 3.5 3 4  
Minimum 4 4 4 4 4 4  
Maximum 3 3 4 3 3 4  
Mode - 3 4 - 3 4

Mean score 3.5 3.33 4 3.5 3.33 4  
Standard error 0.29 0.33 - 0.29 0.33 -

## CHAPTER FIVE

5.1 Discussion of Results: Discussion of results is based on the data and analysis presented in part 4 of this work, shown above.

The level of enthusiasm by which the Church in Nigeria welcomed this study was generally very high and very encouraging. This was evident in the intensity of Church corporate responses that stood at 79%. The general prevailing feeling was that a study was empirically being done, the outcome of which would improve the quality of Christian services in Nigeria. Some Church leaders/founders specifically requested for copies of the report if possible, with willingness to pay for them if need be.

The Total Quality Management concept awareness by general assessment was detected to be very low. Only 46% of 107 respondents which represented 47 Churches out of 110 contacted were aware. It should be noted that the awareness being talked about here was only by definition, by name, not by principles and practice. At principles and practice levels, the figures were much, much lower. (Principles 7% awareness and practice 5% actual).

Many Churches in Nigeria knew nothing about TQM. This inferably explained why surprisingly some of the big outspoken ones did not comment neither did they fill the questionnaires. It was clear, well calculated efforts to cover their ignorance one might say. Though they were not many.

The few that new TQM inside out had actually implemented it. Some of the methods being used, though tailored made to meet the local needs of each Church were quite fruitful. One of those was Winners Chapel, Ota, Lagos whose success story was told on page 140 of this work.

It was noticed that the level of education had to do with TQM implementation and practice in Nigeria. For instance, the three pastors who answered yes to their Churches' TQM practice, each was a Ph.D. holder. Most of the other ones, who either did not reply at all or who totally declined, held lower educational qualifications. And most of those who said TQM should not be mingled with the things of God at all were either stark illiterates or ill educated - and this is true.

The outcome of the application of TQM to Church Management in Nigeria is so far encouraging. At 80% success rate, though the implementation level is still very low, TQM holds a good future in the things of God in this land. The 20% "not successful" response that was recorded, needs to be probed further because it could as well mean result awaiting measurement if TQM has just been implemented in that Church.

All Church organizations that had implemented TQM did not hire external consultants.

The closer they got to that was the invitation of external preachers (both local and foreign) to teach quality related topics in their Churches.

It was interesting to discover that the reasons given for TQM success in Church in Nigeria are the same reasons required for success of TQM practice in any service industry. This is a further confirmation that service remains service anywhere, only its type and method of offering differ from organization to organization.

Organizational Climate can be defined as an enduring characteristic of an organization that is reflected in the attitudes and descriptions which employees make of the policies, practices and conditions that exist in the work environment. For TQM to succeed, a conducive climate is believed to be a must.

Employees who sense a climate of trust for example, will offer maximum commitment to Total Quality Management. Infact, when a climate of trust is in place in the Church setting, the members will be sold on Church goals and objectives just as employees will be sold on company goals in a production outfit if a climate of trust is firmly in place. Conducive climate helped a great deal at making TQM successful in the Church organizations reported as successful in this study. Each respondent rated the following climate factors (among others) as above average.

- Commitment of members to the success of the Church
- Commitment of leadership/followership to quality
- Good level of respect from the leader to Members and vice versa.
- High spirit of oneness.
- Clarity of goals and objectives
- Opportunity for self expression and contribution
- Reward by God that can be physically seen in lives of leaders and members.

## CHAPTER SIX

### 6.1 Summary, Recommendations and Conclusions

Summary: The Church in Nigeria has responded positively to TQM with a very good starting point. The good achievement of Winners Chapel is an eye opener to other Churches. If through the practice of total quality this Church and a few others have been lifted up and high, TQM is therefore a good challenge to take on by others.

In the industrial sector, Americans had to go to Japan after the second world war to learn the “ways” of TQM. In Nigeria as far as the Church is concerned we need not go far. That is why a special study was done on Winners Chapel (the most outstanding successful TQM Church practitioner in Nigeria by our opinion), the result of which is included as part of this report on page 140. What Americans learnt expensively from the Japanese, we can learn easily at no cost from Winners Chapel, Canaan land, Ota, Lagos, Nigeria and adapt it to various visions of our different pastoral callings.

Church organizations without TQM practice are seen all over Nigeria operating or can we say “relaxing” silently due to either lack of awareness of TQM, indifference to it or outright rejection of it.

While they live on in obscurity with members’ souls and life ill catered for, the Church TQM operators are bubbling with life - real life and real fire in the Holy Ghost, with infallible proofs of soul winning daily for the Master according to His instructions in Mark 16:15 to 18.

The “silent” Churches have forgotten that wherever grains of corn are available, there chicken will patronize. The Church TQM practitioners are bubbling with enviable results because they know and practice proper Word nutrition as the Bible recommends in Acts 20 : 28. It is the proper Word nutrition that makes a Church grow numerically not intercession. The traditional Church organizations should stop accusing “modern” Churches as snatching their members. A child not well fed at home must look elsewhere to feed for survival. It is necessary that both the modern and traditional Church organizations should imbibe the concept of Total Quality in other to improve God’s services to humanity through the Church. A Church can succeed through much work and less prayer but no Church can succeed only on prayer without work. TQM operates on principle of serious work that the Church needs badly. Jesus CHRIST practiced it on earth when He was here as discussed elsewhere in this report.

Recommendations: The following recommendations are put forward with the best of intention and without any prejudice or favour to any Church organizations in Nigeria.

1. The level of success by Winners Chapel is very high. It is world class any day, anywhere. Winners Chapel deserves a more detailed study than I have done. Such a study when completed should be documented in a book and made available world over to all Churches. There is much to learn from Winners Chapel and I bet that non Church Organizations also in the service industry will benefit immensely from such additional effort to this one.

2. Because the low level of Church awareness and knowledge of TQM in Nigeria, it is recommended that all Christian Institutions of learning should compulsorily include TQM in their studies. All Seminaries, Church Bible Institutes and the two Christianity inclined Universities in Benin and Lagos should be involved.

3. A new trend in Christendom in Nigeria is being witnessed. External consulting firms on Church Organization and Management are emerging. Their services are being enjoyed by some Churches who discover that they lack expertise in that area.

In the same vein, independent TQM firms should spring up to assist those Churches that cannot handle TQM on their own due to one reason or the other.

4. In the course of this research, I have consulted more than seventy books, 99.9% of which were authored by foreigners. Nigerian authors should rise to the occasion by

giving us books on TQM with Nigerian Orientation. This will further arouse our interest and commitment to TQM.

5. Christian Association of Nigeria (CAN) and its affiliate bodies should come up together with enlightenment campaigns on TQM awareness, practice and benefits. Campaigns can be used to create favorable attitude for TQM as a means of encouraging quality practices in the things of God in Nigeria. A seasoned professional Advertising Agency can be hired to handle the publicity.

6. Internally, Church Organizations should prevent quality failures at least in core areas of Church services such as Word nutrition, corporate goals, climate, trust, communication and objective clarity.

7. Internally also, the Church should teach members and insist that in all aspects of service to GOD (man to God) and man (man to man) the best quality in terms of time, money and materials should be offered as much as possible within individual's reach.

8. On the overall, Christian Association of Nigeria (CAN) should raise and empower a strong Pastoral Registration and Control Unit so as to check and minimize the menace of fake men of God in Nigeria.

It is impossible for CAN to know who is called by God or not, but by the time a registration process is compulsorily put in place, before one can recognizably practice, a level of control will have been achieved. This will sanitize the situation a bit. Pastors called by GOD will willingly register and be identified, one is sure. The fake ones may not do so willingly. And if through audacity any fake Pastor registers, at least an address will be left behind to which he or she can be traced. So also in addition is the fact that at least someone will ask questions in case of misbehaving unlike presently when no one bothers, leaving the society to leak its wounds from time to time.

9. Christian newspaper, television and radio should start in Nigeria. We are actually ripe for them. They will help improve our quality awareness and practice as we read and see the quality practices of others through such media.

Someone may say that statutorily religious media are not and will not be allowed in Nigeria. I believe they can be done with Government approval if rightly packaged. In the last twelve months, who would have thought that Christianity inclined Universities would be possible in Nigeria? But today we have two of them - Lagos and Benin.

10. As practicing Churches are legally registered in Nigeria by Corporate Affairs Commission (CAC), one of the conditions that CAC should ask anyone seeking registration should be to bring a letter of recommendation from CAN.

Before CAN recommends, at least enough information must be made available to it on

the set man of the new Church. One needs to say however that for CAN to do this effectively, a better organization than what it has now on ground is necessary and inevitable.

11. The Church in Nigeria should add to their services, benevolent outreaches to humanity outside the shores of Nigeria like Americans do with Operation Blessings, Doctor without Borders, CBS Medical Team, 700 Clubs, etc.

Conclusions: In Matthew 24 : 3 the disciples asked Jesus by saying, “tell us ... what shall be the sign of thy coming and of the end of the world?” In verse 33 of the same chapter, Jesus answered and said “... when ye shall see all these things (famine, false pastors, flood, fire, earthquakes - verse 4 to 7 of same chapter), know that it is near, even at the doors.”

A manufacturing company may think it has the whole of the future to keep itself in business, the Church does not have that; so also the manufacturing company. The Church and infact all of the World has a limited time left here.

Therefore the King’s assignment (Luke 19:13) requires uttermost urgency. The best of the Gospel should be given through total quality practices now before it is too late. Quality failure avenues need be phased out soonest possible especially in Word nutrition from Church to Church. Christian Association of Nigeria (CAN) has to lead by example and influence others to follow.

Better organization, better planning, better motivation, better management, better activity co-ordination and better structural physical offices nationwide need to be identified with CAN. Some Churches with nationwide spread need to practice more delegation of power based on trust.

Ideas such as all money realized in Church must come to the headquarters first, subordinate Pastors cannot be paid until the headquarters approves and sends funds, petty cash expenses must be endorsed by the founders before they are released, etc. are all limiting factors which do not allow for growth, expansion and the urgent action that God requires of the Church this end time.

The organizational climate must be right and compatible as much as possible at all times. A compatible climate does not only motivate Church workers and members, it gets the work done quickly without compromising quality.

Let me end with the sayings of Paul and Jesus CHRIST “And that, knowing the time, that now it is high time to awake out of sleep, for now is our salvation nearer than when we first believed. The night is far spent, the day is at hand; let us, therefore, cast off the works of darkness (quality failures?), and let us put on the armor of light (TQM?) - Romans 13:11 to 12.”

“Watch ye, therefore; for ye know not when the master of the house cometh, at evening, or at midnight, or at cockcrow, or in the morning. Lest, coming suddenly, He finds you sleeping. And what I say unto you I say unto all, Watch” (Mark 13:35 to 37).

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. Besterfield et al, Total Quality Management, Prentice Hall, 1995.
2. Bossert James L, Quality Function Development: A Practitioner's Approach, ASQC Press, 1991.
3. Brown M. G et al, Why TQM Fails & what to do about it, Small Business Reports, 1994.
4. Bright K. et al, “Organizational Culture and the Management of Quality”, Journal of Managerial Psychology 21-27, 1993.
5. Byrne J. A., “Management's New Gurus”: Business Week, 1992 August 4, P44 - 52.
6. Collins, English dictionary, 1977.
7. Choppin Jon, “Quality through People”: A blueprint for proactive quality management, Bedford, 1991.
8. Crosby Philip, Quality is free, McGraw-Hill, 1979.
9. Cullen Joe Hollingham, Implementing Total Quality, IFS (Publications) Ltd, 1987.
10. Crosby Philip B, Quality without tears, McGraw-Hill, 1984.
11. Counte M.A. et al, TQM in a Health Care Organization: How are employees affected? Hospital and Health Services Admin. 503-517, 1992.
12. Cook J.D. et al, The Experience of Work. New York Academic Press, 1981.
13. David Iornem, How to be a good Manager in ten minutes, JVC Press 1998.
14. Dahlguard J. et al, Fundamentals of Total Quality Management, Chapman and Hall, 1998.
15. Dr. Myles Munroe, “Bahamas Faith Ministries International on Trinity Broadcasting Network”, 2002.
16. Deming Walter, “Out of the Crisis”, Cambridge, 1986.
17. Deming W. Edwards, Quality, Productivity, and Competitive Position, Cambridge, 1982.
18. Dynamic Stringing, “A Structure for Continuous Improvement”: Paper presented at the National Meeting of the Academy of Management Vancouver, Canada, 1995.
19. Donalld J. K. et al, “Building a continuous improvement culture”, printable article, e Library, July 2002.
20. Danjin et al, “Will TQM go the Way of QWL”? Journal for Quality and participation, 1992.
21. Doyle K, “Who's Killing Total Quality?” Incentive 1992.
22. Detoro I. J. et al, “TQM: Three Steps to Continuous Improvement”. Reading, M.A. Addison – Wesley, 1992.
23. Emery C.R, et al, “Using the Philosophy of Mary Parker Follett to Interpret and Address Problems and Failures in Implementation of Continuous Improvement Processes”: Paper presented at the National Meeting of the Academy of Management,

Las Vegas, 1992.

24. Emery C. R. et al, "The role of organizational climate in the implementation of TQM": *Journal of Managerial Issues*, 22/12/1996, P 484.
25. Erickson T. J., "Beyond TQM: Creating the High Performance Business", *Management Review* 58-60, 1992.
26. Feigenbaum A.V., *Total Quality Control*, McGraw – Hill, 1961.
27. Fuchsberg, "Total Quality is termed Only Partial Success", *The Wall Street Journal*, (October 1): B1, 1993.
28. G. A. Cole, *Management: Theory and Practice*, Ashford Colour Press Ltd, 1996.
29. Gilbert John, *A Slice by Slice guide to TQM*, Tudor Publishing, 1992.
30. Gilbert G.R., "Employee Empowerment: Flaws and Practical Approaches", *Public Manager* 45 – 48, 1993.
31. Glover J, "Achieving, the Organizational Change Necessary for Successful TQM," *International Journal of Quality and Reliability Management*, 47-64, 1993.
32. Gestetner ups "Quality Measures", *Africa News Services*, 10/05/2002 – internet.
33. Gagne J, "America's Quality Coaches", *CPI Purchasing*, May 1983, P 27-45.
34. Holy Bible, *The Topical Reference Bible*, Dugan Publishers, 1985.
35. Heinz Wehrich et al, *Management: A Global Perspective*, 10th ed, McGraw Hill, 1993.
36. Harber D. K. et al, "TQM as a cultural Intervention: An integrative Review", *International Journal of Quality and Reliability Management*, 17 – 27, 1993.
37. Ho K. M. Samuel, *Operations and Quality Management*, International Thomas Business Press, 1999.
38. Ishikawa Kaoru, *What is Total Quality Control? – The Japanese way*, Prentice – Hall, 1985.
39. IT Web/All Africa Global, *Media Via Comtex Article* dated 10/05/2002.
40. John S. Oakland, *Total Quality Management: Text with cases*, Heinemann, 1989.
41. Joseph Prokopenko et al, *Productivity and Quality Management 1 & 2 (ILO, 1996)*.
42. Juran J. M., *Juran on Leadership for Quality: New York*, Free press, 1989.
43. Juran Joseph M, *Quality Control Handbook (3rd Ed) McGraw – Hill*, 1979.
44. Kermally Sultan, *Total Management Thinking*, Heinemann, 1996.
45. Kanji G. K. et al, *Total Quality Management Process: a systematic approach*, Carfax Publishing Co., 1993.
46. Kendrick J. J., *TQM: Is it Forging Ahead or Falling Behind Quality?*, 1993.
47. Klein D. J. et al, "Building a Continuous Improvement Culture", *CMA Magazine* Vol.68, 1994.
48. Kid Sadgrove, *Making TQM Work*, Kogan Page, 1995
49. Litwin et al, "Motivation and organizational Climate". Boston: Division of Research, Graduate school of Business admin. Harvard University, 1968.
50. Lawler E.I., "Total Quality Management and Employee Involvement: Are they compatible?" *Academy of Management Executives* 8(1): 68-76,1994.
51. Lowe T et al, "Three Preachers, One Religion", *Quality* September, 1986, 22-25.
52. Macdonald et al, *Global Quality*, Mercury Books, 1990.
53. Munro-Faure et al, *Achieving the New international Quality Standards, a step by step guide to Bs EN ISO 9000*, Pitman Publishing, 1995.
54. Morris L, "Organizational Culture and TQM Implementation, Training and

Development” 48 (4): 69-71, 1994.

55. Mohrmon S et al, “Employee Involvement and TQM: Practices and Results in Fortune 1000 Companies”. San Francisco: Jossey – Bass, 1992.
56. Ouchi W. G., Theory Z. Reading, M. A. Addison – Wesley, 1981.
57. Owen Hilarie, Creating Top Flight Teams, Kogan Page, 1996.
58. Peters Thomas et al, In Search of Excellence, Harper and Row, 1982.
59. Ross E. Joel, Total Quality Management: Text Cases and Readings, St. Lucie Press, 1995.
60. Reichers et al, The Role of Climate and Culture in Productivity, Ed.B. Schneider, San Francisco, 1990.
61. Stahl J. Michael, Management: Total Quality in a Global Environment, Blackwell Publishers Ltd, 1995.
62. Schneider et al, “Some Relationship between Job Satisfaction and Organizational Climate”. Journal of Applied Psychology 318 - 328, 1975.
63. Schwartz et al, Matching Corporate Culture and Business Strategy, 1981.
64. Sullivan J. J., “Japanese Management Philosophies from the vacuous to the Brilliant,” California Management Review (34), 66-87, 1992.
65. Senge P, The Fifth Discipline: The Art and Practice of The Learning Organization, New York: Double day, 1990.
66. Townsend P. L. et al, Commit to Quality. New York: John Wiley and Sons, 1990.
67. Taguchi G, “Introduction to Quality Engineering”, Asian Productivity Organization, 1986.
68. Unruh A. James, Customers Mean Business: Six steps to building relationships that last, Wesley Publishing Co., 1996.
69. Wakhlu Bharat, Total Quality Excellence Through Organization - Wide Transformation, A. H. Wheeler and Co. Ltd., 1994.
70. Wilkinson Adrain et al, Managing With Total Quality Management: Theory and Practice, Macmillan, 1998
71. Wilkins H. Robert, The Quality Empowered Business, Prentice Hall, 1994.
72. Womack et al, The Machine that Changed the World, Rawson Associates/Macmillan, 1990.
73. Westbrook J. D., “Organizational Culture and its Relationship to TQM, Industrial Management”, Jan/Feb, 1-3, 1993.

## APPENDIX I

### LIST OF CHURCHES INTERVIEWED

#### S/NO NAME

1. Abundant Grace Church 4 1 3
2. African Church 4 2 2
3. Altar of Life Bible Church 4 2 2
4. Assemblies of God 4 2 2
5. Baptist Church 4 NIL 4

6. Bethel Ministry 4 NIL 4
7. Bible Believing Church 4 4 -
8. Bible Pattern Church 4 NIL 4
9. Celestial Church 4 NIL 4
10. Chapel of His Glory 4 3 1
11. Chapel of Holiness 4 1 3
12. Chapel of His Power 4 2 2
13. Chapel of Grace 4 1 3
14. Chapel of Grace and Glory 4 1 3
15. Chapel of His Delight 4 2 2
16. Chapel of Love and Unity 4 1 3
17. Chapel of Redemption 4 1 3
18. Champions Chapel 4 4 -
19. Christ Embassy 4 NIL 4
20. Christ Apostolic Church 4 4 -
21. Christ Foundation Assembly 4 NIL 4
22. Christ Fishermen Church 4 NIL 4
23. Christ Gospel Witness 4 2 2
24. Christ Gospel Apostolic Church 4 NIL 4
25. Christian Pentecostal Mission 4 1 3
26. Christian Church International 4 3 1
27. Cherubim & Seraphim 4 NIL 4
28. Church of God Mission 4 4 -
29. Christ Holy Church International 4 2 2
30. Conquerors Assembly 4 1 3
31. Day Star Church 4 4 -
32. Deeper Life Bible Church 4 4 -
33. Demonstration Ministries 4 4 -
34. Dunamis Chapel International 4 1 3
35. ECWA Church 4 1 3
36. Eternal Life Church 4 3 1
37. Faith Anointed Church 4 NIL 4

S/NO NAME

38. First Baptist Church 4 NIL 4
39. Four Square Gospel Church 4 3 1
40. Fountain of Life 4 NIL 4
41. Fountain of Salvation 4 NIL 4
42. Glorious Liberty Assembly 4 2 2
43. Gospel Chapel International 4 4 -
44. Gospel Apostolic Church 4 NIL 4
45. Gospel Assembly 4 1 3
46. Gospel Pentecostal Assembly 4 NIL 4
47. Gospel Aflame International 4 2 2
48. Gospel Missions International 4 3 1

49. Go Ye International 4 1 3
50. Harvesters Church 4 4 -
51. House on The Rock 4 NIL 4
52. Holy Ghost Fire Assembly 4 2 2
53. Household of God 4 3 1
54. Household of Love 4 1 3
55. King's Life Mission 4 4 -
56. Later Rain Assembly 4 3 1
57. Liberation Hall Min. International 4 3 1
58. Liberation Ministries 4 2 2
59. Light and Life Mission 4 3 1
60. Life in the Word Church 4 2 2
61. LifeGate International Church 4 4 -
62. Living Hope Church 4 NIL 4
63. Love and Power Mission 4 3 1
64. Methodist Church 4 3 1
65. Messiah Gospel Tabernacle 4 3 1
66. Mountain of Fire 4 3 1
67. New Life in the Lord 4 3 1
68. New Testament Assembly 4 3 1
69. Overcomers Pentecostal Church 4 2 2
70. Presbyterians Church 4 4 -
71. Pilgrims Assembly 4 4 -
72. Revival Assembly 4 4 -
73. Redeemed Christian Church of God 4 4 -
74. Rhema Chapel International 4 1 3
75. Rhema Miracle Centre 4 4 -
76. Rhema Pentecostal Assembly 4 NIL 4
77. Rock of Ages 4 2 2
78. Royal Assembly 4 3 1
79. Royal Chapel 4 2 2
80. Salem Ministries 4 NIL 4

S/NO NAME

81. Saint Luke Anglican 4 3 1
82. Saint Thomas Catholic 4 4 -
83. Saint Dominic Catholic 4 4 -
84. Saint Mary Catholic Church 4 4 -
85. Saint Leo Catholic Church 4 4 -
86. Saint Peter Anglican Church 4 3 1
87. Seven Day Adventist 4 NIL 4
88. The CHRIST Centre Worldwide 4 4 -
89. Triumphant Christian Centre 4 2 2
90. The Word Outreach Centre 4 NIL 4
91. The Word Assembly 4 2 2

- 92. Temple of His Glory 4 2 2
- 93. Temple of His Presence 4 4 -
- 94. The Apostolic Church 4 NIL -
- 95. The Apostolic Mission 4 4 -
- 96. The Banner of Truth Church 4 1 3
- 97. The Church of the Lord-Aladura 4 NIL 4
- 98. The City of Refuge 4 3 1
- 99. Truth & Life Christian Church 4 3 1
- 100. The Word Bible Church 4 3 1
- 101. The Redeemed Evangelical Mission 4 2 2
- 102. Victorious Army Church 4 4 -
- 103. Voice of the Lord Church 4 2 2
- 104. Winners Chapel 4 4 -
- 105. Winning Word Church 4 3 1
- 106. Wisdom of God in Christ Church 4 2 2
- 107. Word Champions Assembly 4 1 3
- 108. Word Liberation Church 4 3 1
- 109. Word Alive Bible Church 4 1 3
- 110. Zoë Ministries 4 NIL 4

Total 440 233 207

#### Notes

- 1. Total Churches contacted 110
- 2. Total Churches that replied 87 = 79%
- 3. Total Questionnaires served 440
- 4. Total Questionnaires filled & returned 233 = 53%
- 5. Total number of Anathema reasons 16 = 4%
- 6. Total number of Unstated reasons 76 = 17%

#### APPENDIX II

##### SAMPLE OF SUCCESSFUL CHURCH TQM PRACTICE IN NIGERIA

Living Faith Church (a.k.a Winners Chapel)  
Address: Canaan Land, KM10, Idiroko Road, Ota, Lagos, Nigeria.  
Website: [www.winnerscanaanland.com](http://www.winnerscanaanland.com)

Background: The Church started on 2nd May, 1981 when God said to its founder Bishop (Dr.) David O. Oyedepo in a hotel room at Ilesha, Oshun State, Nigeria. "The hour has come to liberate the world from all oppressions of the devil, through the preaching of the Word of Faith; and I am sending you to undertake that task."

TQM Approach: Two methods were used by the founder.

Method One: Thorough Planning which involved:

1. Developing positive attitude to the vision
2. Establishing the right commitment to the vision
3. Laying Aside all weights
4. Facts Finding Missions
5. Skills development
6. Spiritual preparations through fasting and praying
7. Patience.

Method Two: Adoption of a Complete Business Approach to the Things of GOD/Church.

This was built on

1. The Word – Luke 2 : 49
2. Effective and constant communication of mission, methods and processes from the top to Church workers to members.
3. Constant application of total Business Management style which included the physical office lay out and office practices!

Implementation: The following service offering methods (programmes) were put in place and used constantly with adequate preparedness for changes.

Pastoral (A) Pastoral (B) Pastoral (C)

1. Sunday Morning Services 1. Pastoral Care Services of Ministry to Ministries (Children Church inclusive) counseling, prayers and services where other
2. Mid-Week Services laying hands. Churches' ministers draw
3. Breakthrough Summit 2. Faith Theatre: Intensive inspirations for dynamic
4. Breakthrough Night care unit for critically ill ministries through:
5. Thanksgiving & Dedication and bed-ridden people. a. Schools of Ministry. services. b. Ministers' Conferences.
6. Special Covenant c. Pastors' Summits. \anointing service days.
7. Annual Shiloh Gathering

Congregational: (Involvement of members in service offering)

1. Group Fellowships:
  - 1.1 Winners Women Fellowship
  - 1.2 Youth & Singles Fellowship
  - 1.3 Winners Businessmen Fellowship

## 2. Squads:

- 2.1 The Challengers' Squad
- 2.2 The Harvesters' Squad
- 2.3 The Advertisers Squad

## 3. Service Groups:

Sanctuary Keepers, Children's Department, Protocol Unit, Ushering Team, Crowd Control Unit, Hospitality Group, Medical Team, Choir, Decoration Unit, Utility, Traffic Control Unit, Security Team, DOMI Engineering Crew and Bus Service Unit.

4. Believers' Foundation Class (The Word, Prayer, Holy Spirit and Kingdom service are usually taught for 2 Saturdays in this class for new believers in Christ).

5. Winners Satellite Fellowship. Fellowships held by members in residential locations every Saturday, 5 to 6.15pm. Each location is headed by a satellite minister.

6. Testimonies (Glorifying God with infallible proofs)

7. Congregational Fasting and Praying sessions from time to time.

Measurement (Achievements): In addition to thousands of souls already saved through the Church, the following are physically on ground as:

- a. Evidence of the Living GOD's involvement in the Church.
- b. Evidence of the usefulness and appropriateness of Total Quality Management (TQM) concept to Church Management.

The Successful achievements are:

1. Winners has the world's largest Church auditorium pillar free, sitting more than 60,000 people at a go.

2. 500,000 membership strong in Nigeria, West Africa, Africa and Europe.

3. World of Faith Bible Institute with Campuses in Lagos, throughout Nigeria and in foreign African Missions. Over 100,000 students already graduated.

4. Dominion Publishing House owned by the Church and so far has published more than seventy different titles for the Church, in English and some in French. The titles vary under the following generic topics of:

Faith - 11 The Word - 4

The Supernatural - 7 The Holy Spirit - 5

Prosperity - 6 Prayer - 2

Healing - 3 Wisdom - 12

Success - 7 Vision - 6

Consecration - 5 Praise - 3

5. Dominion Bookstores: Established and functioning at Lagos (Headquarters), all over Nigeria and in foreign missions.
6. Faith Academy: Co-educational boarding school, situated at the Church's international headquarters, Canaan Land, Ota, Lagos, Nigeria.
7. Covenant University (CU): Owned entirely by the Church. CU has a very recent signed agreement with Oral Roberts University (ORU) in America for the promotion of intellectual dialogue and exchange of staff and students on annual basis.
8. Gilead Medical Centre: Community Social Service which blends science with the spiritual for human health purposes.
9. Covenant University Guest House. A three star hotel, well run for Christian relaxation and social activities.
10. Diocese: The Church has 7 Dioceses in Nigeria, each headed by a Bishop in company of many pastors. The Dioceses are Abuja, Ilorin, Ibadan, Kano, Part Harcourt, Owerri, Warri. In some Dioceses, there are as high as 16 Churches under one Diocese. The Kaduna Church/Diocese is the National Headquarters while Lagos remains the International Headquarters.
11. Camp House Lodging Facilities (For rest and quest times for members).
12. LFC Church owned Hospitals in Nigeria and some African Countries.
13. World Mission Agency (WMA). For the Focus of the Gospel on the World.
14. Domi - David Oyedepo Ministries.
15. Work Force: Pastors, 1,500; full time employees, 2,000.
16. AGIP (Africa Gospel Invasion Project). This is the foreign impact and spread arm of The Church in Africa under the following regions, Nigeria excluded.
 

West Africa: Ghana (2), Gabon, Cote D'ivoire, Liberia, Gambia, Addiss Ababa, Guinea Bissau, Guinea Conakry, Cameroon, S/Lean, Niger Republic, Burkina Faso, Togo, Chad, Senegal, Benin, Mauritius, Cape Verde & Mali.

East Africa: Kenya (6) Uganda (2), Ethiopia, Tanzania (2), Madagascar & Malawi.

Central Africa: Zambia, Congo (3) and Central Africa Republic (CAR).

South Africa: Namibia & Johannesburg.

Winners as a Church has astonished everyone worldwide with their divine laudable achievements through principled modern management techniques, based on continuous improvement of services and processes. The achievements are so loud that people troop in to behold the wonders of God among men on earth. The other day it was the world renowned evangelist R. Bonnke that came, followed by Dr. Wagner of Global Harvest Ministries, USA. Nigerian President, Ministers, Senators, Governors, international speakers ( e. g. Dr. Myles, Bishop (Mrs.) Vaughn) and many international figures troop there daily.

Theirs is a clear confirmation that TQM concept application (which is evident even in all their physical structures) is quite applicable and practicable not only in the Church but in the service industry generally. Winner's proofs are quite astonishingly infallible! Glory to be GOD.

### APPENDIX III SAMPLE OF RESEARCH QUESTIONNAIRE

Hello Sir/Ma; My name is Rev. Success Fadipe (Founder and Snr. Pastor, The CHRIST Centre Worldwide). I am a Doctoral Degree (Management) student of St. Clements University, Australia. I am conducting a Research on "Church Awareness and Practice of Total Quality Management (TQM) in Nigeria." Please take 10 minutes to answer some questions. Be assured that your answers will be kept completely confidential. Remain blessed in Jesus CHRIST forever.

#### PART 2 (INTRO)

1. Name of Your Church? .....Your Sex: Male or Female?

2. State your position in the Church?

.....

#### PART 3 (AWARENESS):

1. Have you heard of Total Quality Management (TQM): YES or NO ?

2. Are you aware of its principles: YES or NO ?

3. Have you ever been personally involved in its practice: YES or NO ?

4. Do you think its principles are good and applicable to Church Management in Nigeria: YES or NO ?

5. Does your Church practice TQM: YES or NO ?

6. Does your Church practice improving its services on continuous basis: YES or NO ?

7. Does your Church improve its people from time to time by training: YES or NO ?

8. Do you have a quality service improvement Department in Church: YES or NO ?

9. Has your Church ever brought in teachers who teach quality practice to members: YES or NO?

10. Do you have a group or department in Church that monitors service performance: YES or NO ?

11. Has your Church ever changed its service procedure due to peoples' demand: YES or

NO ?

12. By your knowledge of TQM, do you think a Church that practices it will perform better than the one that doesn't: YES or NO ?

#### PART 4 (IMPLEMENTATION):

If TQM has been or is being implemented by your Church,  
Please tick which of the following methods is or are being used?

1 Dissemination of knowledge of Quality from the Head down to groups down to individuals by constant training, teaching and practice.

2 Implementation of Total Quality through hired consultants

3 Leadership commitment and practice of Total Quality which naturally rubs down on members in the Church.

4 Through a Quality group set up and saddled with responsibility to formulate and Implement the concept of Total Quality in service offering by the Church.

5 Dependence on the Holy Ghost, the Word and invited guest speakers who teach in Church from time to time.

#### PART 5A (PRACTICE CLIMATE)

How will you rate the following for your Church?

1. The commitment of members to the success of your Church.

Excellent : Above Average : Average : Below Average : Unsatisfactory

2. The level of respect by the leadership to members and vice versa.

Excellent : Above Average : Average : Below Average : Unsatisfactory

3. The level of respect from members to members.

Excellent : Above Average : Average : Below Average : Unsatisfactory

4. The level of members togetherness and co-operation in the Church.

Excellent : Above Average : Average : Below Average : Unsatisfactory

5. The quality of training and development offered by the Church.

Excellent : Above Average : Average : Below Average : Unsatisfactory

6. The usage of members' skills for the things of God by the Church.

Excellent : Above Average : Average : Below Average : Unsatisfactory

7. The quality of direct supervision by the Church.

Excellent : Above Average : Average : Below Average : Unsatisfactory

8. The clarity of Church goals and objectives.

Excellent : Above Average : Average : Below Average : Unsatisfactory

9. The willingness of members to reveal problems.

Excellent : Above Average : Average : Below Average : Unsatisfactory

10. 10. The willingness of leaders to listen and take action.

Excellent : Above Average : Average : Below Average : Unsatisfactory

11. The willingness of members to obey and apply Church policies.

Excellent : Above Average : Average : Below Average : Unsatisfactory

12. Reward by God for good and obedient performances as can be seen in the life of members.

Excellent : Above Average : Average : Below Average : Unsatisfactory

PART 5B (PRACTICE GENERAL): Please tick appropriately.

NO DON'T KNOW

1. After GOD, people are the main focus of service in our Church: YES or NO ? YES

a. Our Church leader preaches and practices quality service to God & mankind:

YES or NO ? YES NO DON'T KNOW

3. Our Church is God and people loving & satisfying constantly: YES or NO ?

YES NO 4. Quality in key service areas is general knowledge and practice in our Church:

YES or NO ? YES NO DON'T KNOW

5. Quality Service to God and mankind is a propelling force for our being in service for God

in our Church: YES or NO ? : YES NO DON'T KNOW

6. Honest mistakes are usually converted to improvement lessons in our Church:

7. YES or NO ? YES NO DON'T KNOW

7. Laudable innovative service ideas are usually acknowledged by the Church and rewarded by God: YES or NO ? YES NO DON'T KNOW

8. General enthusiasm of members is on the high side in our Church: YES or NO ? YES

9. We understand the Bible and its vision for our Church clearly: YES or NO ? : DON'T KNO

10. Our Quality practice affects us, all round, including the Word, care for people, materials, Church building and surrounding: YES or NO ?

11. The entire Church works together as a family under God: YES or NO ? YES NO

12. Our Church commits its resources to serve God and humanity constantly: YES or NO

? : 13. Suppliers of the Word, Money, Time & Materials to our Church are aware of giving their best in terms of quality: YES or NO ? YES NO DON'T KNOW

14. Our Church's performance and growth are as a result of divine blessings and our positive attitude to total quality most of the time: YES or NO ? YES NO DON'T

15. To my mind, Churches in Nigeria now practice quality in offering their Services: YES or NO ? YES NO DON'T KNOW

PART 6 (OUTCOME): By observation and personal judgment, I think the application of Total Quality in my Church has been:

1. Very Successful

2. Successful Tick as appropriate.

3. Unsuccessful

4. Don't know

PART 7 (REASONS): In your opinion, which of the following reasons might have contributed to your choice in part 6 above – please tick one or more.

A leader called by God with a clear purpose and vision which are well communicated to members.

Consideration of people as first after God as main target of our service.  
Total leadership and followership commitment and doggedness to quality in realization of common goal, vision and mission.

Effective and constant training of Church people and workers regularly which is in place.

Constant practice of the two way communication method.  
Proper monitoring and adequate co-ordination and control of people and activities.  
All of the above or Non of the above. If non, please state what it is?

---

---

---

---

Thank you Sir/Ma, may God bless you richly.

The end – To the Glory of GOD.